

;;;BCC 180530

>>> MY NAME IS MATT O'MALLEY.
WE ARE HERE TO DISCUSS DOCKET
0177.

THIS WAS AUTHORED BY MYSELF
AND DEAR COLLEAGUE AND FRIEND
TO MY LEFT MICHELLE WU.
ALSO ED FLYNN IS HERE.
THE CITY WILL TAKE BIDS FOR
RENEWABLE SOURCES ABOVE THE
RPS RENEWABLE STANDARD AS WELL
AS BIDS FOR RENEWABLE OFTEN
AGOGATION.

THIS IS SUCCESSFUL MODEL.
WE HAD A WORKING MISSION.
IN AUGUST OF LAST YEAR WE
FILED AN AUTHORIZATION
HEARING.

ON OCTOBER 3 WE HOSTED A
MARATHON MEETING.
FOLLOWING DAY THE CITY COUNCIL
UNANIMOUSLY PASSED THE ORDER.
WE WERE DELIGHTED.

TO CHECK IN ON PROGRESS AS
WELL AS TALK ABOUT CHALLENGES
THAT HAVE ARISEN WE FILED A
HEARING AGAIN.

COUNCIL WU AND I THIS YEAR TO
KEEP UP WITH STAKEHOLDERS.
IN FEBRUARY 20th OF THIS
YEAR THE ENVIRONMENT
DEPARTMENT RELEASED IT RFI
REQUEST FOR INFORMATION.
WE'LL GET INTO MORE SPECIFICS
ON THAT INCLUDING WHY IT WAS
AN R.F.I. AS OPPOSED TO AN
R.F.P. I DID WANT TO PASS
ALONG TWO NOTES.

ONE FROM COUNSELOR TIMOTHY.
I APOLL APOLOGIZE FOR NOT
ATTENDING TODAY BECAUSE I'M
HOME WITH PNEUMONIA.

THESE POLICIES WILL HELP SAVE
OUR PLANET.

I'M LOOKING FORWARD AT LOOKING
AT THE TAPE AND WHAT WILL
RESULT FROM THE HEARING.

WE HOPE YOU FEEL BETTER SOON.
LYDIA EDWARDS WRITES THANK YOU
FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP AND
ADVANCE IN CLEAN ENERGY.

I SUPPORT THE SWIFT ACTION AND
GRATEFUL FOR FOR BOSTON

SUPPORT.

IT'S IMPORTANT TO UNDERSTAND
THIS HAS NUMEROUS SAFEGUARDS
BUILT-IN.

I SUPPORT CRAFTING AS AN
AGGREGATION PROPOSAL WE SHOULD
MOVE SWIFTLY TO ENSURE TIMELY
COMPLETION OF THE PROCESS.

I SUPPORT THE CREATION OF A
GROUP TO OVERSEE THE
IMPLEMENTATION.

ARROGATOR CAN'T I REGRET NOT
BEING ABLE TO JOIN YOU TODAY.
PLEASE READ THIS INTO THE
TESTIMONY.

I WOULD LIKE TO TURN THE FLOOR
OPEN TO MICHELLE WU FOR
OPENING THOUGHTS.

>> THANK YOU MR. CHAIRMAN AND
THANK YOU FOR THOSE WHO HAVE
TAKEN YOUR TIME TO BE HERE
AGAIN AND GAIN AND AGAIN.
WE LOOK FORWARD TO GETTING AN
UPDATE AND PUSH FORWARD FOR A
SWIFT MOTION.

EVERYDAY WE ARE NOT DOING THIS
WE ARE MISSING OUT ON THE CITY
BEING GREENER THANK YOU.

>> THANK YOU, CHAIR O'MALLEY
AND THANK YOU FOR THE
LEADERSHIP OF COUNCIL WU AS
WELL.

I'M THANKFUL TO ATTEND TODAY'S
MEETING.

I HOPE THIS HEARING TODAY CAN
HELP US UNDERSTAND WHAT NEXT
STEPS ARE NEEDED.

I KNOW COMMUNITY CHOSE ENERGY
HAD GREAT SUCCESS.

I HOPE WE CAN WORK TOWARDS
IMPLEMENTATION.

I WOULD LIKE TO THANK YOU MR.
CHAIRMAN FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP.

>> THANK YOU COUNSELOR FLYNN.
I'M GOING TO READ A BRIEF
LETTER FROM MYTHOGRAPHER.

MARTHA GROVER.

ADDRESSES TWO POINTS I WANTED
TO READ BEFORE WE GET INTO OUR
PANEL.

IT READS: THE CITIES AND
TOWNS AROUND MASSACHUSETTS
CHOSE TO OFFER AN AFFORDABLE
ELECTRIC SUPPLY OPTION WHICH

IS FIVE YEARS AHEAD OF THE STATE'S REQUIREMENT.
AS IT CITY OF BOSTON CONSIDER THEIR NEXT STEPS I OFFER TWO MAIN TAKEAWAYS FROM THE EXPERIENCE.
FIRST, THE DECISION BY THE MAYOR IN JUNE OF 2017 TO END OUR PROGRAM AFTER A SUCCESSFUL 18 MONTHS WAS THE RIGHT DECISION AT THE TIME FOR MELROSE RATEPAYERS AND WASN'T CONSIDERED A FAILURE BY ANYONE.
THIS WAS TO LOOKOUT FOR THE INTEREST OF OUR RESIDENCE JUST AS IT ELECTRICITY PROGRAM IN 2017.
A SPIKE IN OUR LOAD ZONE WHICH WAS FIVE TIMES THE HISTORICAL AVERAGES AND MANOR THE NATIONAL GRID TO SET RATES AS AN AVERAGE ACROSS ALL THREE ZONES RESULTED IN AN INABILITY TO SECURE AND SUPPLY BIDS THAT WERE LESS THAN BASIC SERVICE. COMMUNITIES AND TERRITORY DIDN'T RECEIVE THE SAME DISADVANTAGE.
THE SUCCESS OF AGGREGATION AND PRECURING RATES EVEN WITH ADDITIONAL LOCAL RENEWABLE ENERGY.
NOW THAT PRICES ARE FALLING AGAIN. OUR NEW MAYOR IS RESUBMITTING AN AGGREGATION PLAN WITH THE HOPES TO RELAUNCH OUR PROGRAM IN EARLY 2019.
THE BOARD OFFALLERMAN SUPPORTED THIS INITIATIVE AT AN APRIL MEETING.
THE SECOND TAKEAWAY FROM THE PROGRAM THAT WAS UNEXPECTED AND FOR ME ONE OF THE MOST IMPORTANT ASPECTS IS THE RAISED LEVEL OF AWARENESS OF GENERAL KNOWLEDGE ABOUT THEIR ELECTRIC BILLS AND WHERE THEIR ENERGY COMES FROM.
MANY I HEAR FROM ARE SENIOR CITIZENS OR THOSE WITH LOW AND FIXED INCOMES THAT APPRECIATE THE FACT THERE IS SOMEONE THAT

CAN HELP THEM UNDERSTAND THEIR BILL AND REFER THEM TO THE LOCAL OFFICE FOR HEATING AND ASSISTANCE.

AT OUR ANNUAL SENIOR FAIR MY TABLE IS THE BUSIEST BECAUSE NO ONE ESTIMATE IS OUT THERE GIVING THEM THE SAME UNBIAS INFORMATION AND ASSISTANCE ABOUT SOMETHING THAT'S UNNECESSARILY COMPLICATED.

THEIR MANTILLA ELECTRIC BILL. AFTER THE PROGRAM ENDED I WAS ASKED TO GIVE PRESENTATIONS AT LOCAL LOW INCOME HOUSING COMPLEXES AND SENIOR CENTERS. THE MOST VULNERABLE ARE BETTER PREPARED TO HANDLE MARKETING CALLS TO THOSE SELLING OVER PRICED CONTRACTS.

THEY JUST SAY WITH CONFIDENCE THEY ARE IN THE CITY PROGRAM AND HANG UP OR SHUT THE DOOR. THEY CAN'T WAIT FOR OUR PROGRAM TO RETURN.

I APPLAUD YOUR EFFORT AND I'M HAPPY TO OFFER ASSISTANCE. SINCERELY MARTHA GROVER.>> . MANY OF OUR COLLEAGUES ARE HAPPY ABOUT THIS.

WE ALL WANT THIS TO WORK. LET'S FIGURE OUT HOW TO MAKE THIS WORK AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE.

DID YOU WANT TO START WITH THE VIDEO?

>> LET'S START WITH OPENING REMARKS.

>> PERFECTS.

ALISON, IF YOU COULD INTRODUCE YOURSELF AND WE'LL MOVE DOWN TO YOUR RIGHT.

>> THANK YOU.

SURE, HI.

I'M ALISON, I'M THE DIRECTOR OF ENVIRONMENTAL PLANNING.

I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS YOU MIGHT HAVE.

I HAVE TWO MAJOR UPDATES SINCE THE LAST HEARING.

AFTER COMPLICATIONS WE RELEASED AN FRI IN FEBRUARY. IT INCLUDED QUESTIONS ABOUT PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION.

PROCUREMENT OF SUPPLY AND
PROGRAM REC., AND PRICING.
WE SHARED THIS WITH EXPERTS
AND COMMUNE BETY COMMUNITY
GROUPS.

WE DIRECTLY REACHED OUT TO
NEARLY 100 GROUPS SEEKING
INFORMATION IN RESPONSE TO THE
R.F.I. WE RECEIVED 19
RESPONSE AND THEY ARE
AVAILABLE ONLINE.

MOST OF THEM TOUCHED ON
RENEWABLE ENERGY PROCUREMENT
STRATEGIES.

THEY ALSO PROVIDED
INVESTIGATION TO DEVELOP A
PROGRAM.

WE DIDN'T RECEIVE AS MUCH
INFORMATION ON PRICING.

WE WERE HOPING THEY WOULD
SHARE THEIR PRICE DATA THAT
WOULD ALLOW US TO ESTIMATE
COST SAVINGS TO RATEPAYERS.

WE ARE STILL SEEKING THIS
INFORMATION ON PRICING AND
LOOKING INTO OTHER SOURCES OF
INFORMATION.

WE EXPECT CARBON TREE BOSTON
TO GIVE US INFORMATION.

THEY WILL LOOK AT THE GAS
HOUSE PROCESS AND ASSESS THEIR
LONG-TERM BENEFITS AND COST.

THIS WILL PROVIDE VALUABLE
INFORMATION.

THE MAYOR REQUESTED FUNDING
FOR TECHNICAL ANALYSIS.

I LOOK FORWARD TO ANSWERING
ANY QUESTIONS YOU MIGHT HAVE.

>> THANK YOU.

, IT'S A PLEASURE

TO BE HERE AND I APPRECIATE
YOU INVITING ME.

I THE SUSTAINABILITY DIRECTOR
FROM THE CITY OF NEWTON.

NEWTON IS MOVING AHEAD WITH
C.C.A. BEFORE WORKING FOR THE
CITY I WAS THE CHAIR OF
UTILITIES UNDER GOVERNOR
PATRICK.

THEY REVIEW AND APPROVE
MUNICIPALITY PROPOSED
AGGREGATION PLAN.

I JUST WANT TO START BY SAYING
THAT MUNICIPAL AGGREGATION IS

A HUGE SIGNIFICANT ENVIRONMENTAL PROGRAM. I WILL REALLY HAVE TO TRY TO PERSUADE THE FOLKS IN THE ROOM OF THAT.

MUNICIPAL AGGREGATION IS THE MOST SIGNIFICANT THING CITIES AND TOWNS CAN DO TO LOWER THEIR GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS.

ALSO, IT'S NOT NECESSARY TO REINVENT THE WHEEL. OVER 140 CITIES AND TOWNS HAVE THESE PROGRAMS.

THIS IS NOT ROCKET SCIENCE. THE MOST IMPORTANT THING ANY CITY OR TOWN CAN DO TO GET MUNICIPAL AGGREGATION ROLING IS TO -- ROLLING IS TO HIRE AN AGGREGATION CONSULTANT.

THEY WILL KNOW THE ANSWERS TO ALL OF THE QUESTIONS BOSTON POSED IN IT'S R.F.I. HOWEVER, IT WON'T BE ABLE TO ANSWER YOUR QUESTIONS ON PRICING.

TRYING TO GET PRICING INFORMATION NOW WILL NOT BE FRUITFUL.

BOSTON IS CLEARLY AT LEAST A YEAR AND HALF AWAY FROM ENTERING INTO A SUPPLY CONTRACT.

NO ONE IS GOING TO BE ABLE TO TELL YOU NOW WHAT THE PRICES WILL BE THEN.

WILL ELECTRICITY CUSTOMERS SAVE MONEY?

MAYOR FULLER IN NEWTON COMMITTED IN HER STATE OF THE CITY ADDRESS OF MY GIVING 100 PRESENTATIONS OVER THE COURSE OF THIS YEAR TO COMMUNITY GROUPS ABOUT MUNICIPAL AGGREGATION.

I ASSURE YOU THAT EVERY SINGLE ONE ASKED IF THEY WOULD SAVE MONEY OR END UP SPENDING MORE MONEY.

I HAVE BEEN CAUTIOUS NOT TO PROMISE TO ANYONE THAT THEY WILL SAVE MONEY.

WE HAVE NOT DECIDED WHAT OUR RENEWABLE COMPONENT WILL BE. EVEN WITHOUT A GREEN COMPONENT

THERE WILL LIKELY TO BE TIMES
OVER THE DURATION OF THE
MUNICIPALITY SUPPLY CONTRACT
WHEN ELECTRICITY WILL BE
HIGHER THAN EVER SOURCES
PRICES AND TIMES WHEN IT WILL
BE LOWER.

OVER THE DURATION OF THE
CONTRACT, EVEN WITH A
REASONABLY SIGNIFICANT
RENEWABLE COMPONENT.
ELECTRICITY RATEPAYERS SHOULD
BE ABLE TO SAVE MONEY.
I WOULD BE CAREFUL NOT TO
GUARANTEE THAT.

A 5% RENEWABLE COMPONENT IS
VERY INEXPENSIVE.
THE MONEY THAT WILL BE SAVED
SHOULD NOT NECESSARILY
DEFINITELY WILL BUT SHOULD
COVER THE COST OF THE 5% AND
PERHAPS MORE THAN THE 5%.
EVERY HOUSEHOLD CAN LOWER
THEIR PRICES ENOUGH TO KEEP
FROM A POTENTIAL INCREASE.
SO IT SHOULDN'T COST MORE THAN
EVER SOURCES RATES.

THERE ARE SO MANY
OPPORTUNITIES DO LOWER A
HOUSEHOLDS ELECTRICITY BILL.
OKAY, JUST TO CLEAR UP A FEW
POINTS OF CONFUSION THAT ARISE
SOMETIMES.

ADDRESSING MARTHA'S POINT.
SHE HAS USED THE TERM PAUSE.
YOU CAN'T PAUSE AGGREGATION.
YOU CAN'T POP IN AND OUT OF
AGGREGATIONS.

INDIVIDUALS CAN, CITIES AND
TOWNS CAN'T.
YOU CAN UNDERSTAND WHY THAT'S
THE CASE.

EVER SOURCE HAS TO PLAN FOR
IT'S LOWS.

ALSO CITIES AND TOWNS ENTER
INTO THEIR OWN SUPPLY
CONTRACT.

THEY CAN'T POP IN AND OUT OF
THOSE SUPPLY CONTRACTS.
INDIVIDUALS CAN OPT OUT AT ANY
TIME WITH NO PROBLEMS.

OTHER CONFUSES THAT ARISE IS
THIS IS AN OPT OUT PROGRAM.
YOU AS A RATEPAYER ARE IN THE

PROGRAM UNLESS YOU DO
SOMETHING TO GET YOURSELF
OUT.
THAT'S A MATTER OF STATE LAW.
THE CITIES AND TOWNS CAN'T
CHANGE THAT.
YOU CAN GIVE PEOPLE A LOT OF
OPTIONS.
THEY CAN GO TO 100%.
THEY ARE OPT OUT ENTIRELY.
AS DESIGNED.
THIS IS AN OPT OUT PROGRAM.
SO, THAT'S REALLY ABOUT IT.
I JUST WANT TO EMPHASIS WHAT
AN IMPORTANT PROGRAM THIS IS
IN ORDER TO REDUCE THE
GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS OF A
CITY OR TOWN.
ALSO POINT OUT, AS ALREADY
BEEN MENTIONED.
THERE IS SIGNIFICANT CONSUMER
PROTECTION ASPECTS TO THESE
PROGRAMS.
PEOPLE WHO ARE PARTICIPATING
IN THE MUNICIPAL AGGREGATION
PROGRAMS CAN IGNORE ALL OF THE
CALLS AND E-MAILS THAT ASK
THEM BUY ELECTRICITY FROM ME
AND THEY DON'T KNOW WHETHER
SOME OF THESE ARE SCAMS.
WHAT THE COST OF GETTING OUT
AT SOME POINT IN THE FUTURE
ARE.
THESE ARE TRUSTWORTHY CITY
VETTED PROGRAMS THAT PROTECT
CONSUMERS.
>> THANK YOU.
THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY
TO SPEAK TODAY.
I'M LIZ THE DIRECTOR OF THE
APPLIED CLINIC.
WE ARE BASED IN SUMMERVILLE.
WE ARE A NONPROFIT GROUP
PROVIDING INFORMATION ON
ENERGY, ENVIRONMENT, AND
EQUITY ISSUES.
WE HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO
STUDY BOSTON'S PROGRAM.
AGAIN, IN MARCH WE UPDATED THE
NUMBERS AS THEY BECAME
AVAILABLE.
UPDATES CAN BE FOUND ON OUR
WEBSITE.
I JUST WANTED TO GO OVER A FEW

OF THE MAIN RESULTS OF THAT AGAIN TO HAVE IT IN THE RECORD HERE.

I'LL START BY WHOLEHEARTEDLY SECONDING THE VERY MEASURED DISCUSSION OF BENEFITS THAT THE FORMER COMMISSIONER JUST PROVIDED.

OUR LOOK AT THE BENEFITS WAS LOOKING INTO THE PAST TO SEE WHAT HAS HAPPENED SO FAR FROM MUNICIPALITIES IN MASSACHUSETTS.

IN LOOKING AT THAT HISTORY TO SEE WHAT COULD BE POSSIBLE FOR BOSTON GOING FORWARD.

WHAT WE FOUND WAS THAT, THUS FAR, MUNICIPALITIES HAVE SAVED MONEY FOR THEIR CONSUMERS.

THE REASON FOR THE SAVINGS ARE THESE PROGRAMS HAVE LOW ADMINISTRATIVE COSTS.

THERE IS THE INCREASINGLY COMPETITIVE COST OF RENEWABLE GENERATION AS COMPARED TO OTHER GENERATIONS.

THERE IS THE ROLE OF THE MUNICIPALITY BEING BIG ENOUGH TO BARGAIN IN A WAY WHERE AN INDIVIDUAL HOUSEHOLD OR SMALL BUSINESS CONSUMER ISN'T.

OF COURSE, IN ADDITION TO THE POTENTIAL ECONOMIC BENEFITS FOR BOSTON CONSUMERS THERE ARE ENVIRONMENTAL BENEFITS.

ENGAGING IN COMMUNITY CHOSE ENERGY AGGREGATION.

ENVIRONMENTAL BENEFITS INCLUDING MORE LOCAL RENEWABLE ENERGY AND GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS.

I CAN SPEAK AS A RESIDENT IN ARLINGTON WE HAD A SUCCESSFUL ROLLOUT OF THIS IN OUR TOWN. BOSTON IS MUCH LARGER THAN ARLINGTON THAN ANY OTHER MUNICIPALITIES.

WE HAVE DIFFERENT CONSIDERATIONS FOR BOSTON.

ON THE WHOLE, I EXPECT THAT THE SIZE OF BOSTON PUTS IT AT AN ADVANTAGE, NOT A DISADVANTAGE.

BOSTON'S LARGER SIZE WILL PUT

IT IN A STRONGER BARGAINING
POSITION.
BOTH IN TERMS OF IT'S ABILITY
TO BARGAIN IN TERMS OF RATES
AND BARGAIN FOR THE PER
KILOWATT HOUR ADMINISTRATIVE
COST OF A MANAGING GROUP OR AN
AGGREGATION CONSULTANT.
I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER QUESTIONS
ABOUT THE RESULTS OF OUR STUDY
IF THAT'S HELPFUL.
>> THANK YOU VERY MUCH.
WE WILL GET TO THAT.
GOOD MORNING, THANK YOU
COUNSELOR WU AND O'MALLEY TO
SPEAK ON THIS TOPIC.
ALSO SPIDER-MAN TO TAKE
TIME-OUT OF YOUR BUSY
SCHEDULE.
I'M VINCENT VONN.
I'M THE MANAGER AT
DORCHESTER.
THIS IS A NONPROFIT BASE IN
BOSTON.
WE DRIVE SOLUTIONS THROUGHOUT
THE ECONOMY.
POWERFUL NETWORKS TACKLES THE
BIGGEST SUSTAINABILITY
CHALLENGES INCLUDING CLIMATE
CHANGE AND HUMAN RIGHTS
ABUSES.
THIS PAST WINTER BROUGHT
CLIMATE CHANGE TO LIFE IN
BOSTON.
THESE STORMS MUST SEVER AS AN
URGENT CALL IN BOSTON.
WE NEED TO ACT NOW AND ACT ON
CLIMATE.
IF WE PRESERVE OUR CITY.
IN WASHINGTON D.C. OUR LEADERS
ARE GOING BACKWARDS AND NOT
FORWARD.
THEY ANNOUNCED PULLING OUT OF
THE CLIMATE AGREEMENT AND
BUILD A PROSPEROUS FUTURE FOR
ALL AMERICANS.
OTHERS ARE STEPPING UP.
WE ARE SEEING LEADERSHIP RISE
FROM NEW PLACES.
CITIES, STATES, PRIVATE
COMPANIES ARE STEPPING UP TO
DO THEIR PART FOR A
SUSTAINABLE ECONOMY.
LAST YEAR THEY JOINED TOGETHER

WITH OVER 2,700 PEERS ACROSS
THE UNITED STATES.
THEY DECIDED WE ARE STILL IN
DECLARATION.
WE PROMISED TO DO OUR PART SET
FORWARD IN THE CLIMATE
AGREEMENT.
THE CLIMATE ACTION PLUS
REPRESENTS OVER \$30 TRILLION
IN ASSETS TO GET COMPANIES TO
CUT THEIR EMISSIONS.
BOSTON DESERVES CREDIT FOR
SPEAKING OUT IN THAT MOMENT.
THAT MESSAGE THAT BOSTON IS
STILL IN SHOWED THE REST OF
THE WORLD WE WILL STAY IN THE
AGREEMENT.
WE KNOW DECLARATIONS WON'T
STOP THE WATERS FROM RISING
AND STORMS FROM GETTING
STRONGER.
THE BOLDEST WORLDS ARE NOT
ENOUGH TO PROTECT OUR CITY.
WE NEED TO GET RESULTS AND NOT
DELAY.
THERE ARE COST-EFFECTIVE
SOLUTIONS WE CAN IMPLEMENT
RIGHT AWAY.
SOLUTIONS THAT CAN SAVE BOSTON
RESIDENCE MONEY.
SHIPPING FROM FOSSIL FUELS AND
MAKE A BIG IMPACT NOW.
THE COST OF WIND AND SOLAR ARE
WELL BELOW THE COST OF
TRADITIONAL FOSSIL ENERGY.
BUSINESSES ACROSS BOSTON
WILLPOWER THAT OPERATIONS WITH
RENEWABLE ENERGIES.
130 COMPANIES COMMITTED TO
GOING 100% RENEWABLE INCLUDING
IKEA, NIKE, APPLE, AND MORE.
THEY HAVE ALSO SET CLEAN
ENERGY GOALS.
THEY ARE TAKING ACTION BECAUSE
THEY WANT TO BE LEADERS IN
ADDRESSING THE CLIMATE
CRISIS.
IF WAL-MART CAN CHOSE 100%
ENERGY SURLY BOSTON CAN AS
WELL.
IF WE'LL MEET THE AGREEMENT IN
THE PARIS AGREEMENT.
WE NEED EVERYBODY, NOT JUST
CORPORATE AMERICA TO MAKE THE

SHIFT TO CLEAN POWER.
THERE ARE STILL BARRIERS THAT
ARE KEEPING SMALL BUSINESSES
AND RESIDENCE FROM USING THAT
ENERGY.
THE LARGE LEGAL TEAMS TO DO
WHAT THESE COMPANIES HAVE
DONE.
THAT'S WHAT COMMUNITY CHOSE
AGGREGATION SO IMPORTANT.
PULLING OUR BUYING POWER WE
CAN GIVE SMALL BUSINESSES AND
RESIDENT THE SAME ACCESS TO
POWER THE SAME AS U.S.
COMPANIES.
BOSTON IS A NATIONAL LEADER ON
CLIMATE.
IF WE ACHIEVE OUR GOAL 25% BY
THE YEAR 2020 AND HELP THE
UNITED STATES AND WORLD
ACHIEVE OUR GOAL FOR FUTURE
GENERATIONS WE NEED URGENT
ACTION.
IT'S TIMES TO REMOVE THE
BARRIERS FROM PEOPLE ENJOYING
CLEAN ENERGY.
WE MUST MAKE THAT IMPACT RIGHT
AWAY.
>> THANK YOU, WINSTON.
THREE QUICK HOUSEKEEPING
MATTERS.
THIS IS TELEVISED.
MAKE SURE YOU ARE AWARE IF YOU
WISH TO TALK.
I WOULD LIKE TO THANK COUNCIL
FLAHERTY.
THIRD THERE IS A TESTIMONY
SIGN-IN SHEET AT THE BACK IF
YOU WOULD LIKE TO TESTIFY.
PLEASE DO SO.
I HAVE SEVERAL SHEETS
ALREADY.
WE WILL MAKE SURE WE GET TO
EVERYBODY.
WE'LL GO THROUGH A QUICK ROUND
OF QUESTIONS BY COUNCILORS.
I WANT TO BE MINDFUL AND
RESPECTFUL OF EVERYBODIES
TIME.
I WILL IMPOSE A 5 MINUTE LIMIT
ON EVERY COUNSELOR.
I'LL BEGIN NOW.
ALTON, I'M DELIGHTED TO HAVE
YOU WITH US.

I'M DISAPPOINTMENT CHIEF
BLACKMAN IS NOT WITH US AS
WELL.

AS WINSTON SAID, THERE IS NOT
ONLY LACK OF LEADERSHIP IN
WASHINGTON THERE IS HOSTILITY
THAT MANY HOLD DEAR.

WE ARE WORKING TO ADVANCE
THINGS.

IT'S UP TO CITIES AND TOWNS TO
LEAD ON CLIMATE.

I KNOW YOU SUPPORT IT.

I'M A LITTLE CONCERNED.

THE WAY WE SUBMIT THE RFI MAY
HAVE TIED OUR HAND AROUND OUR
BACK AS WE TRIED TO GET THIS
OFF THE GROUND.

MY QUESTION TO YOU IS WHY DID
WE INCLUDE THE PRICING
INFORMATION ON THE R.F.I. WHEN
VERY FEW BUSINESSES WOULD BE
ABLE TO PROVIDE SUCH A THING.
>> A POINT OF CLERRIFICATION.

THE -- CLARIFICATION THE
PRICING INFORMATION WE WERE
SEEKING WE WERE AWARE THEY
WOULDN'T BE ABLE TO GIVE US.
FUTURE PRICING THEY WOULD BE
ABLE TO.

WE WERE LOOKING FOR A SINGLE
POINT OF COMPARISON IN THE
PAST HAD WE SAY LAST YEAR
INSTITUTED CCA. WHAT WE CAN
TELL WITH THE PRICING AND WHAT
WOULD THE COST HAVE BEEN TO
OUR RESIDENCE IF WE
IMPLEMENTED IT LAST YEAR.

IT'S A POINT OF INFORMATION.
>> IS THAT TYPICAL.

DID NEWTON DO THAT OR
ARLINGTON?

>> I CAN'T SPEAK TO ARLINGTON
BUT NEWTON DID NOT DO THAT TO
MY KNOWLEDGE.

I PERSONALLY, THE DPU, THERE
WERE 3COM THREE
COMMISSIONERS.

WE APPROVED 70 OR 80 PLANS.

I'M NOT SURE OF EVERYTHING
THAT OCCURRED AT THE MUNICIPAL
LEVEL.

I DIDN'T HEAR ANYTHING ABOUT
THE CITIES AND TOWNS GOING OUT
WITH THE R.F.I. HAVING A

CONSULTANT IS IMPORTANT.
THAT'S WHAT ALL CITIES AND
TOWNS HAVE DONE TO GET THE
KIND OF INFORMATION YOU WERE
LOOKING FOR.

>> WHAT WENT WRONG?
EN YOU SAY WHAT WENT
WRONG --

>> WE DIDN'T RECEIVE ANY --
RESPONSE TO THE QUESTION ON
THE R.F.I.

>> WE RECEIVED RESPONSE TO THE
OTHER QUESTIONS.

BECAUSE THE QUESTION WASN'T
LISTED THAT SHUT IT DOWN.

>> NO, WE RECEIVED A LOT
OVALBLE INFORMATION FROM THE
R.F.I. ON THE OTHER THREE
TOPICS THAT WE HAD NUMEROUS
QUESTIONS.

IT WAS THAT QUESTION THAT WE
DIDN'T RECEIVE RESPONSE TOO
AND WE BELIEVE THAT'S AN
IMPORTANT PIECE OF
INFORMATION.

>> WE ARE NOT MOVING FORWARD?
NO, WE ARE.

WE BELIEVE AN IMPORTANT
COMPONENT IS TO RECEIVE THAT
INFORMATION.

>> YOU ARE IN THE HOT SEAT
TODAY.

I KNOW YOU CARE DEEPLY ABOUT
THIS.

WHAT IS THE REASONABLE
TIMELINE THAT YOU GUYS THINK
WE COULD ACTUALLY MAKE THE
SWITCH?

>> AS YOU SAID, WE ARE
ABSOLUTELY COMMITTED TO MOVING
FORWARD.

WE NEED TO MAKE SURE IT'S
GOING TO BE A PROGRAM THAT
DISINTERFECT OUR

OUR RESIDENCE. DISINTERFECT
DOES NOT EFFECT OUR

WE HOPE TO HAVE THAT PEACE IN
THE FALL.

WE ARE CONTINUING TO MOVE
FORWARD AND LOOK FOR THAT
INFORMATION.

>> I GUESS IT'S GETTING
FLUSTERING BECAUSE I FEEL LIKE
THIS IS A RECURRING THING OF

KICKING THE CAN DOWN THE ROAD
SO TO SPEAK.
THERE WAS OPPOSITION, NOT FROM
YOU BUT OTHERS WITH THE
PLASTIC BAG ORDNANCE.
I WORRY THAT, AS EVERY MONTH
MOVES ON WE ARE DROPPING THE
BALL HERE TO MIX METAPHORS.
I GUESS MY LAST QUESTION, I'M
OVER FIVE MINUTES.
VERY BRIEFLY, DO YOU THINK THE
WAY BOSTON ROLLED OUT OUR
RFI'S WAS PROBLEMATIC AND IS
THERE ANOTHER APPROACH WE
SHOULD TAKE BRIEFLY.
>> I'LL TAKE A SHOT AT THAT.
I KNEW NOTHING ABOUT BOSTON'S
APPROACH UNTIL 3 DAYS AGO.
LAST THING I WANT TO DO IS BE
CRITICAL OF WHAT BOSTON HAS
DONE.
FROM COMING AT IT FROM THE
NEWTON PROSPECTIVE AND THE
PUBLIC'S PROSPECTIVE.
YOU HAVE PROBABLY GOTTEN
USEFUL INFORMATION IN RESPONSE
TO THE R.F.I. YOU SHOULD DO
AN R.F.P. AND GET AN
AGGREGATION CONSULTANT.
>> R.F.P. IS FOR PROPOSAL.
R.F.I. IS FOR INFORMATION.
>> ONCE YOU GET THE CONSULTANT
ALL OTHER CITIES AND TOWNS
HAVE DONE THAT.
WE GOT THREE RESPONDENTS.
ONE OF WHICH WAS FROM A STATE
OTHER THAN MASSACHUSETTS AND
HAD NO EXPERIENCE WITH OUR
STATE AGGREGATION APPROACH.
SO WE EFFECTIVELY HAD TWO
HIGHLY CONFIDENT CONSULTANTS
BID IN.
WORKING WITH THE CONSULTANT WE
CHOSE HAS BEEN EASY AND
EFFICIENT AND ANSWERED ALL OF
THE QUESTIONS IN THE R.F.I.
THAT ARE ANSWERABLE AT THIS
MOMENT.
I JUST WANT TO REITERATE THAT
COMMUNITY CHOSE AGGREGATION IS
NOT ROCKET SCIENCE.
IT'S IN A STATE LAW OF THREE
PARAGRAPHS.
IT'S 140 OTHER CITIES AND

TOWNS HAVE DONE THAT.
40 OF WHICH HAVE DONE GREEN
AGGREGATION.
IT'S NOT THAT COMPLICATED.
>> OKAY, DID YOU WANT TO
RESPOND TO THAT.
>> I JUST WANTED TO ADD
BRIEFLY.
ONE STEP WAS TO CONSULT WITH
THE TWO ORGANIZES AND THEY
WANTED TO TAKE THE R.F.I. AS
IT FIRST STEP.
>> WAS IT THEIR SUGGESTION OR
DID WE PRESENT IT AND THEY
SAID THAT'S FINE.
>> I WOULD HAVE TO GET BACK TO
YOU ON THAT.
I WASN'T IN THAT MEETING.
>> OKAY.
COUNCIL WU.
>> THANK YOU.
I THINK WE KNOW WHAT THE
MAIN PUSH OF TODAY WILL BE.
I JUST WANT TO, AT THE
EXPENSE, WHY NOT JUST HIRE AN
CONSULTANT?
>> ISSUE ANÑi R.F.P.
YES, TO GET THE INFORMATION
WE NEED TO MOVE FORWARD.
UNDERSTANDING THAT THIS ISN'T
A BUDGET ISSUE EITHER FOR THE
CITY.
THE CONSULTANTS WORK ON IF THE
CONTRACT IS TO FLOURISH.
>> WOULD ANYONE ELSE LIKE TO
CHIME IN?
>> GENERALLY THE WAY IT WORKS
IS THAT 2 RATEPAYERS AND ONCE
THE AGGREGATION IS ACTUALLY IN
PLACE THE RATEPAYERS END UP
PAYING A TINY FRACTION OF
THEIR ELECTRICITY COSTS TO THE
CONSULTANT.
THAT'S THE WAY THEY GET
FUNDED.
THERE ARE A FEW, WELL, I'LL
SAY MAYBE A HANDFUL OF CITIES
AND TOWNS THAT HAVE PUT
MUNICIPAL FUNDING, ADDITIONAL
FUNDING INTO SUPPORTING THE
PROGRAM.
THAT'S NOT TRUE OF MOST CITIES
AND TOWNS.
IT IS THE CASE THAT NEWTON

PAYS MY SALARY, NOT THAT MUCH
I'LL ADD.
IT'S NOT THE ONLY THING I DO.
I WORK ON MUNICIPAL
AGGREGATION.
GENERALLY SPEAKING, CITIES AND
TOWNS DON'T KICK IN MONEY TO
FUND THE MUNICIPAL
AGGREGATION.
THE CONSULTANT IS AT RISK FOR
THE WHOLE YEAR OR MANY MONTHS
ANY WAY THAT THE CONSULTANT
WORKED TO GET THE PROGRAM OFF
THE GROUND.
THEY DON'T GET PAID.
THEY HAVE TO WAIT UNTIL THE
SUPPLY CONTRACT IS SIGNED AND
THE PROGRAM IS FULLY IN PLACE
TO GET ANY MONEY.
>> SO, CAN YOU EXPLAIN.
THIS IS NOT YOU.
THIS IS OTHERS.
I'M SORRY YOU ARE HERE TO
ABSORB THIS.
IF WE KNOW THE WAY TO MOVE
FORWARD MOST EFFICIENTLY IS TO
ISSUE THE R.F.P. FOR THE
CONSULTANT TO HELP US FIND THE
INFORMATION.
IF YOU KNOW, AS YOU SAY THE
CITY INTENDS TO MOVE FORWARD.
WHY NOT MOVE FORWARD.
WHY CONTINUE TO DELAY UNLESS
WE THINK THERE IS SOME REASON
IT WOULD NOT POTENTIALLY MOVE
FORWARD?
>> SO, MY UNDERSTANDING IS
PART OF THE REASON WE MOVED
FORWARD WITH THE R.F.I. WAS TO
GET THE INFORMATION WE NEEDED
TO DRAFT THE R.F.P. AND SET
THE BUDGET.
THIS PRICING INFORMATION IS OF
USE TO US AND IMPORTANCE TO US
TO UNDERSTAND WHAT SCALE OF
R.F.P. TO MOVE FORWARD WITH.
ALSO, SOME OF THE RESPONSE TO
THE R.F.I. INDICATED IT'S
STILL AN OPEN QUESTION ABOUT
WHAT TYPE OF AGGREGATION
CONSULTANT WE WOULD WANT TO
SELECT.
SOME SET THEIR PRICING PER
HOUR, CORRECT.

YOU SAID THERE WILL BE A FEE
UP-FRONT.

>> I'M ACTUALLY NOT AWARE OF
ANY AGGREGATION CONSULTANT
THAT DOESN'T GET PAID IN THE
FASHION THAT I JUST
INDICATED.

THAT IS AS A PERCENTAGE, A
TINY PERCENTAGE.

THE KILOWATT HOURS THAT ARE
BEING PURCHASED UNDER THE
AGGREGATION.

IT'S NOT REQUIRED FOR THE CITY
ITSELF TO SPEND ANY MONEY TO
FUND THE CONSULTANT ALTHOUGH,
A FEW CITIES AND TOWNS HAVE
CHOSEN TO DO THAT.

>> THAT'S WHAT I WAS REFERRING
TO.

THAT'S AN ADDER.

>> WELL, IT COULD WORK THAT
WAY OR THE CITY OF NEWTON HAS
PUT INTO IT'S BUDGET ABOUT
\$25,000 FOR COMMUNITY
ENGAGEMENT EFFORTS.

SO, YOU KNOW, A VERY SMALL
AMOUNT OF MONEY TO HELP
EDUCATE THE COMMUNITY.

ESSENTIALLY, THE FUNDING IS
COMING OUT OF RATEPAYERS -- A
PERCENTAGE OF WHAT RATEPAYERS
PAY.

>> ONE ISSUE WE ARE LOOKING AT
AT OUR SCALE THAT WOULD BE A
SUBSTANTIAL COST.

WE WOULD WANT TO EVALUATE.

WE WERE CAUSOUS IF THAT
CURIOUS IF THAT'S THE RIGHT
APPROACH.

--

>> DO YOU FORESAY SITUATION
THAT WE WOULD DO THIS WITHOUT
A CONSULTANT OR A CONSULTANT
WITH THE NO ADDER.

>> THOSE ARE OPTIONS WE ARE
EVALUATING RIGHT NOW.

>> I KNOW I'M RUNNING OUT OF
TIME.

HAVE YOU CONSULTED WITH OTHER
MUNICIPALITIES LIKE NEWTON OR
MELROSE?

>> YES, WE CONSULTED WITH
OTHER MUNICIPALITIES OF OUR
SIZE AND A NUMBER WAY CROSS
ACROSS MASSACHUSETTS.

--

>> SEEMS LIKE THEY WILL BE
ABLE TO PROVIDE YOU WITH THE
INFORMATION WE DIDN'T GET.
>> IT WAS THE HISTORICAL
PRICING INFORMATION.
>> WOULDN'T THEY TELL US HOW
MUCH THEY PAID?
>> I CAN LOOK INTO THAT.
MY UNDERSTANDING IS WE HAVEN'T
RECEIVED IT FROM ANY SOURCE.
IF THEY HAVE THAT INFORMATION
AVAILABLE WE'LL WELCOME IT.
I CAN CONFIRM WHETHER OR NOT.
>> IS THAT SOMETHING CITIES
ARE WILLING TO SHARE IF
ANOTHER CITY ASK FOR IT
DIRECTLY?
>> DON'T WORRY ABOUT HAVING TO
PUSH THAT.
>> A FEW THINGS.
WE HAVE PERFORMED A SURVEY OF
MUNICIPALITIES OF HAVING
SIMILAR PROGRAMS ABOUT WHAT
BOSTON IS PROPOSING AND FOUND
EXACTLY THIS IS HOW TOWNS ARE
DOING IT.
JUST TO BE CLEAR.
I FEEL LIKE, MAYBE A LITTLE
CONFUSION IS ENTERED.
WHEN WE TALK ABOUT THE ADDER,
THE SMALL COST PER KILOWATT
HOUR.
IT'S A SMALL COST AND ISN'T
SOMETHING THE TOWNS ARE PAYING
OUT OF THEIR BUDGETS.
CONSUMERS PAY IT AS AN ADDER.
IT'S A TINY INVISIBLE ADDER.
IT'S NOT A MUNICIPAL OUTLET.
>> I THINK AT THE LAST WORKING
SESSION MAGGIE HAD JUST SAID
HER RECOMMENDATION WAS TO ALSO
THINK ABOUT PAYING CONSULTANTS
OR EXTERNAL VENDORS FOR THE
SERVICES RENDERED.
IF THEY GAINED SOMETHING FROM
BOSTON'S CONTRACT THAT'S GIVEN
THE SIZE OF OUR CITY IT COULD
BE MORE THAN OTHER CITIES AND
TOWNS.
>> EXACTLY.
I JUST FEEL LIKE THAT ISN'T
AN APPROPRIATE EXCUSE.
WE KNOW HOW TO GET THERE.
WE KNOW WHAT WE WANT TO DO.

SEEMS LIKE WE ARE WAITING FOR INFORMATION THAT IF WE JUST DIRECTLY ASK PEOPLE FOR WE WOULD RECEIVE.

PROFESSOR, YOU HAVE GOTTEN THAT INFORMATION AS A RESEARCHER REACHING OUT TO CITIES AND TOWNS.

>> SO, I'M NOT AWARE, I'M BETTING -- WELL, I'M NOT AWARE OF ANY CITY OR TOWN OF THE 140 THAT HAS GONE FORWARD WITHOUT AN AGGREGATION CONSULTANT. I DON'T THINK THAT'S A VIABLE OPTION.

IN TERMS OF THE INFORMATION ON PRICING OR HISTORICAL PRICING I DON'T THINK THAT'S REALLY A USEFUL SOURCE.

WE WOULD CERTAINLY BE HAPPY TO SHARE BUT THAT'S NOT GOING TO BE USEFUL.

WE HAVEN'T GONE FORWARD YET. IF BOSTON GETS AN AGGREGATION CONSULTANT IT WILL BE INEVITABLY A CONSULTANT WITH A FAIR AMOUNT OF EXPERIENCE WITH AGGREGATIONS IN THE COMMONWEALTH AND THAT CONSULTANT CAN TELL YOU WITH RESPECT TO THE CITIES AND TOWNS WHAT THE PRICING EXPERIENCE BE HAS BEEN.

THERE ISN'T A WORLD OF EXPERIENCE OUT THERE WITH RESPECT TO GREEN+WE'RE TALKING ABOUT 30 OR 40 ONLY IN THE COMMONWEALTH AND TWO OR THREE AGGREGATION CONSULTANTS IN THIS STATE EACH OF WHICH HAS A BIG PIECE OF THE EXPERIENCE. SO IT'S NOT DIFFICULT TO GET THE HISTORICAL INFORMATION. NOW INFORMATIVE THAT HISTORICAL INFORMATION WILL BE ABOUT THE FUTURE IS A DIFFERENT QUESTION. BUT THIS INFORMATION IS AVAILABLE.

>> HE SO I GUESS I'M WAY OVER TIME.

MY FILM POINT FOR THIS FIRST ROUND, HOW SOON WOULD YOU BE WILLING TO COMMIT, THERE'S SO MANY PEOPLE WILLING TO HELP AND RESOURCES AND FOLKS WHO HAS

INFORMATION YOU'RE SAYING THAT WE NEED, WOULD YOU COMMIT TO CONVENING A COMMUNITY ADVISOR GROUP AS THE COUNCIL ORDER REQUESTED AND WE HAVE BEEN TOLD IN CONSIDERATION BUT NOT YET READY TO MOVE FORWARD.

>> I THINK THAT'S STILL SOMETHING WE'RE ABSOLUTELY EVALUATING THE TIME RIGHT.

>> OKAY.

JUST TO BE CLEAR COMMISSIONER, YOU DID SAY YOU WOULD BE, EVEN THOUGH YOU DON'T HAVE THE INDICATIVE PRICING, YOU WOULD BE MORE THAN HAPPY TO SHARE ANY INFORMATION WITH THE CITY OF BOSTON THROUGH A CONSULTANT.

>> WE'D APPRECIATE THAT.

THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

>> ALL RIGHT.

COUNCILOR ANYONE.

>> THANK YOU FOR BEING HERE AND FOR YOUR WORK ON SO MANY ISSUES ACROSS THE CITY.

I KNOW THE GOAL OF COMMUNITY CHOICE ENERGY IS TO ALLOW CUSTOMERS THE CHANCE TO CONTROL WHAT KIND OF ENERGY THEY RECEIVE BY OFFERING GREENER OPTIONS THAT MANY LOCAL POWER GENERATORS WOULD PROVIDE.

LOWER ELECTRICITY RATES, ENHANCED CONSUMER PROTECTIONS. INCREASING VOLT TECHNOLOGIES AS WELL.

I WAS JUST CURIOUS, WHAT TYPE OF OUTREACH ARE YOU DOING TO ENGAGE BOSTON RESIDENTS ON THIS.

WHAT'S THE RESPONSE BEEN FROM PEOPLE THROUGHOUT THE NEIGHBORHOODS AND, YOU KNOW, HOW CAN WE ALL WORK TOGETHER TO COME UP WITH A BETTER SOLUTION.

>> SO WE HAVE A NUMBER OF VERY ACTIVE OUTREACH EFFORTS GOING ON AROUND RENEWABLE ENERGY. ENERGY EFFICIENCIES AND OTHER PROGRAMS IN THE CITY.

A LOT OF THAT IS RUN THROUGH THE GREENER BOSTON PROGRAM.

THAT INCLUDES ALSO THE RENEW BOSTON PROGRAM THAT IS OUT THERE DOING DIRECT OUTREACH TO

COMMUNITY MEMBERS, HELPING THEM
CONNECT WITH SAFE PROGRAMS, AT
HOME ENERGY AUDITS.

WE EXPECT TO BE WRAPPING CCA AN
OUTREACH AROUND THAT AFTER WE
HAVE THE INFORMATION WE NEED
INTO THOSE ACTIVE AND ROBUST
OUTREACH OUTLETS AND ENGAGEMENT
OUTLETS AND TO BE DEVELOPING
DEDICATED OUTREACH PROGRAMS
AROUND CCA.

>> THANK YOU.

THANK YOU WE'VE BEEN JOINED BY
COUNCILOR ZAKIM.
COUNCILOR FLAHERTY.

>> THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN.

I OBVIOUSLY SUPPORT THE TWO LEAD
SPONSORS AS WELL AS COMMUNITY
CHOICE ENERGY.

I CAN UNDERSTAND THE
ADMINISTRATION'S PERSPECTIVE NOT
WANTING TO ROLL OUT SOMETHING
THAT'S ACTUALLY GOING TO COST
THE CONSUMER MORE.

WE'RE NOT QUITE SURE THAT WOULD
MAKE SENSE IN AN OPT IN/OPT OUT
SITUATION.

I'LL JUST SPEAK FROM THE
PERSPECTIVE OF COMPETITION.
COMPETITION'S GOOD, IT'S
HEALTHY, IT'S GOOD IN SPORTS AND
IT'S GOOD IN POLITICS AND GOOD
IN BUSINESS AND MOST DEFINITELY
WOULD BE GOOD IN ENERGY
PROCUREMENT.

WE HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO MAYBE
LEARN LESSONS FROM THE
NEIGHBORING CITY OF NEWTON AND
WE CONTINUE TO DOUBLE DOWN WITH
BOTH THE CHAIR AND THE LEAD
SPONSORS TO FIND A WAY TO MAKE
THIS A REALITY.

SO WHETHER OR NOT THE COUNCIL
HAS TO LEAD AN EFFORT AROUND
SORT OF OUR OWN RFI TO GET
INFORMATION THAT THE
ADMINISTRATION DOESN'T HAVE BUT
TO COUNCILOR WU'S POINT, I THINK
A LOT OF GREAT MINDS IN THIS
ROOM AND OUTSIDE THIS ROOM I
THINK COULD FILL THE GAPS THAT
COULD GIVE FOLKS THE COMFORT
LEVEL THAT IS MUCH NEEDED IN THE
CITY OF BOSTON.

SO WITH THAT I APPRECIATE IT AND
TURN IT BACK OVER TO THE CHAIR.
>> THANK YOU COUNCILOR FLAHERTY.
COUNCILOR ZAKIM.

>> THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR.

GLAD I COULD BE HERE.

I VIEWED THE VIDEO TAPE OF THE
EARLIER SEGMENT I COULDN'T BE
HERE BUT I LOOK FORWARD TO
WORKING WITH YOU AND COUNSELOR
WU AND CO-SPONSORS WITH THIS TO
GET COMMUNITY CHOICE ENERGY
IMPLEMENTED AS WE WENT THROUGH A
RIGOROUS PROCESS LAST YEAR OR
WAS IT EVEN 2016 TO BEGIN THIS
AND I WANT TO THANK EVERYONE FOR
BEING HERE AND PUSHING THIS
AGENDA TO MAKE US A MORE
ENVIRONMENTALLY FRIENDLY
COMMUNITY.

THANK YOU.

>> THANK YOU COUNCILOR ZAKIM.

I GUESS I ONLY HAD THE TIME FOR
YOU AND I.

VERY SUCCINCT COLLEAGUES.

WE'RE GOING TO DO A BRIEF FOUR
OR FIVE MINUTES OF VIDEO
TESTIMONY AND THEN WE'LL DO A
SECOND ROUND OF QUESTIONS AND
THEN WE'LL OPEN UP PUBLIC
TESTIMONY.

THANK YOU, KERRY JORDAN.

>> I'M FROM BPS I AM TIRED OF
HAVING THIS EVERY TIME

[INDISCERNIBLE] CONSCIOUSLY TURN
ON THE LIGHTS KNOWING TOO WELL
THAT I AM DAMAGING THE ONLY
WORLD WE HAVE TO LIVE ON

[INDISCERNIBLE] MY LIFE WHEN
THERE ARE EQUAL FENDLY RATES
LIKE [INDISCERNIBLE] TO SAVE OUR
PLANET AND THE ENERGY WE NEED TO
SUSTAIN OURSELVES.

>> I'M ALSO [INDISCERNIBLE] THIS
IS THE FIRST TIME I READ ABOUT
GLOBAL WARMING.

I UNDERSTOOD HOW OUR SOCIETY IS
VERY FOSSIL FUELS

[INDISCERNIBLE] PEOPLE IN POWER
HAVE ACKNOWLEDGED

[INDISCERNIBLE] SUCH AN
IMPORTANT RESOURCE FOR THIS
PROBLEM BECAUSE OUR PRIORITIES
ARE IN MAKING MONEY WHICH IS

REALLY [INDISCERNIBLE] FROM REAL
GLOBAL LIFE OR DEATH ISSUES.
WHAT YOU SEE IS THE MOST LOGICAL
SOLUTION TO CARBON GAS HERE.

>> [INDISCERNIBLE] I WAS
DECEIVED BECAUSE I CARE ABOUT MY
TEACHERS [INDISCERNIBLE] PROVIDE
MANY WAYS IN HELPING CLIMATE
CHANGE.

OF COURSE [INDISCERNIBLE]
BECAUSE THE CRUCIAL FACTOR IN MY
LIFE YOU SEE SOMETHING THAT WILL
HELP US IN THE LONG RUN.

OUR FUTURE IS [INDISCERNIBLE] I
WANT MY CHILDREN, I WANT MY
FAMILY I WANT THE FUTURE
GENERATION TO LIVE IN A PLACE
THAT'S SAFE AND CLEAN AND
HEALTHY ENVIRONMENT.

>> HI.

MY NAME'S ADAM AND I'M A STUDENT
IN BOSTON PUBLIC SCHOOLS.

AS A YOUNG PERSON, CLIMATE
CHANGE IS SOMETHING I COULD
CONSIDER IN MY EVERY DAY LIFE.
THIS ISSUE HAS BEEN DUMPED ON US
BY PREVIOUS GENERATION WITHOUT
CONSIDERING ALL THE LIVES IT
WILL IMPACT.

AS SOMEONE WHO WANTS TO GROW UP
IN A WORLD WHERE I CAN DRINK
CLEAN WATER AND BREATHE CLEAN
AIR AND SEE MY COUSIN DANIEL
GROW UP WITHOUT BOSTON DEALING
WITH THE SEA LEVEL RISE.
THIS IS A NECESSARY BEAR MINIMUM
AND LONG OVERDUE FIRST STEP.

>> MY NAME'S [INDISCERNIBLE], I
LIVE IN JAMAICA PLAINS.
TRULY CHOICE NERK WAS PASSED
UNANIMOUS BY THE CITY COUNCIL
AND SIGNED BY MAYOR WALSH SEVEN
MONTHS AGO.

WE NEED TO IMPLEMENT COMMUNITY
CHOICE ENERGY BECAUSE IT GIVES
BOSTONIANS ACCESS TO CLEAN
ENERGY WITH NO EXTRA CHARGE AND
NOT EVEN EXTRA INCONVENIENCE.

ALSO, IT'S ALREADY BEEN
IMPLEMENTED IN OVER 125 CITIES
AND TOWNS ACROSS MASSACHUSETTS,
WHY NOT BOSTON?

WELL WHY BOSTON?

BOSTON IS A COASTAL CITY.

WE NEED TO BE A LEADER IN
ADOPTING CLEAN ENERGY.
SO I URGE THE CITY OF BOSTON TO
IMPLEMENT CCE NOW.
>> CLEAN AIR ENERGY.
>> ALL RIGHT, WE'RE HERE AT THE
CURLY SCHOOL.
WHAT'S YOUR NAME.
>> TARA.
>> WHAT'S YOUR NAME.
>> BENJAMIN.
>> AND WHAT'S YOUR NAME.
>> AMELIA.
>> TARA, HOW OLD ARE YOU.
>> I'M SEVEN.
>> HOW ABOUT YOU.
>> [INDISCERNIBLE]
>> HOW ABOUT YOU AMELIA HOW OLD
ARE YOU.
>> THREE.
>> THREE.
>> TWO AND-A-HALF.
>> WHAT ARE YOU GUYS EXCITED
FOR.
>> COMMUNITY CHOICE ENERGY.
>> WHEN DO WE WANT IT.
>> NOW.
>> THAT'S RIGHT.
>> [INDISCERNIBLE]
>> THAT'S THE BOSTON CITY
COUNCIL.
CAN YOU GUYS SAY A BIG THANK
YOU.
>> THANK YOU.
>> YES.
AND LET'S GET IT IMPLEMENTED AS
SOON AS POSSIBLE.
OKAY.
>> WORK EACH AND EVERY DAY.
THEY'LL DO A SECOND ROUND OF
QUESTIONS BEFORE YOU GET TO
PUBLIC TESTIMONY.
AND I GUESS, I'M GLAD WE SHOWED
THOSE ADORABLE MOVIES AND I
THINK IT UNDERSCORES THE FACT
THAT THERE'S NOBODY -- WELL
THAT'S NOT TRUE, I THINK UTILITY
COMPANIES MAY NOT WANT IT BUT
OTHER THAN THAT, PEOPLE ARE
EXCITED ABOUT THIS.
THE FACT THAT THE MIDDLE OF AN
AFTERNOON WE'VE GOT THIS TWO
THIRDS FILLED WITH ACTIVISTS
FROM ALL OVER, FROM EVERY

NEIGHBORHOOD.

I'M BEING SOMEWHAT RESPELTIVE
BUT I'M JUST TRYING TO WRAP MY
HEAD AROUND IT.

WE'VE BEEN THROUGH THIS.

WE HAD NEARLY TWO YEAR PROCESS
OF SEVERAL HEARINGS, SEVERAL
WORKING SESSIONS, YOU KNOW,
FOLKS THAT WERE OUT OF COMMUNITY
MEETINGS TESTIFY WHY WE WANT
THIS, WHY IT WAS IMPORTANT.

ADVOCATES IN THIS ROOM MET WITH
EVERY SINGLE COUNCILOR, MET WITH
THE MAYOR'S ADMINISTRATION, GOT
A UNANIMOUS VOTES.

THERE AREN'T THAT MANY UNANIMOUS
VOTES ON THIS BODY ON MAJOR
POLICY ISSUES SUCH AS THIS.

THE MAYOR SIGNED IT.

WE'RE SO GRATEFUL FOR THAT AND I
GUESS IT'S JUST A FRUSTRATION WE
FEEL THAT WE'RE BEING SET UP FOR
FAILURE.

AND I GUESS HOW CAN WE ADDRESS
THAT.

HOW CAN WE FIX THAT.

HONESTLY TELL ME WHY I'M WRONG
OR WHY MY SUSPICIONS ARE
MISPLACED IN THIS THING.

WHAT IS A REALISTIC TIME LINE
AND APPROACH THAT WE CAN TO GET
AND IMPLEMENT A CC.

>> I RESPECTFULLY DISAGREE.

I THINK WE'RE VERY COMMITTED TO
ENERGY CHOICE ENERGY.

WE AGREE WE WANT TO HAPPEN.

BUT WITH A CITY AS LARGE AS
BOSTON WE WANT TO MAKE SURE WE
ARE PROCEEDING DELIBERATELY AND
IMPLEMENTING IN A WAY THAT DOES
NOT END UP CAUSING HARM TO OUR
RESIDENTS.

WE WANT TO DO IT RIGHT THE FIRST
TIME.

>> I AGREE.

I AGREE COMPLETELY.

>> SO THE FIRST STEP --

>> BUT JUST, WE DON'T EVEN KNOW
THAT WE CAN COMPLETE.

ANN SAID AND SHE KNOWS THIS
BETTER THAN MOST A 5% RENEWAL
COMPONENT IS VERY EXPENSIVE.

THE MONEY SHOULD OFFSET THE
INCREASE COST.

IT SHOULD.

IT'S NOT A GUARANTEE.

IF WE GET TO A POINT WHERE IT'S NOT GOING TO WORK, AT LEAST WE KNOW WE'VE TRIED.

I FEEL WE'RE NOT AT THAT POINT YET BECAUSE ARE WE'RE NOT IN MY OPINION MAKING A GOOD FAITH EVIDENT TO TRY TO GET THAT BALL DOWN THE FIELD.

>> SO ON THAT POINT, SO WE MOVED IMMEDIATELY TO COMPETITION WITH THE DOE, WE RELEASE THE RFP.

WE NO DOUBT HIT A ROAD BLOCK, RFI, EXCUSE ME.

DELIBERATELY TO RELEASE THE RFI. WE GOT A LOT OF VALUABLE INFORMATION FROM IT BUT NOT ALL THE INFORMATION WE WANT.

WE WANT INFORMATION ON COSTING THAT WE CAN TAKE TO RESIDENTS WHEN WE DO OUTREACH ABOUT THIS PROCESS.

WE THINK IT'S AN IMPORTANT NEXT STEP AND WE'RE MOVING AS QUICKLY AS WE CAN TO IDENTIFY SOURCES FOR THAT INFORMATION AND OTHER SOURCES OF INFORMATION THAT WE CAN.

IF ANYONE CAN HELP US WITH THAT STEP, WE'RE VERY MUCH SEEKING THE INFORMATION.

>> I HAVE MANY PEOPLE THAT COULD HELP DO IT.

>> GREAT.

>> WE ABSOLUTELY WELCOME THE INFORMATION AND WE'RE GOING TO CONTINUE TO MOVE FORWARD WITH CARBON-FREE AND OUR OTHER PROCESSES INCLUDING THIS TO MAKE SURE THAT WE IMPLEMENTED IN THE MOST RESPONSIBLE WAY POSSIBLE.

>> YES, I APPRECIATE THAT ALLISON.

I WILL JUST SAY TWO THINGS. SHE GETS THERE, YOU KNOW, AND AGAIN THIS ISN'T DIRECTED TOWARDS YOU.

I'M SORRY THAT YOU'RE SITTING THERE, I'M SORRY YOU'RE DOING THIS AGAIN WITH ME -- TWO HOURS SO THANK YOU FOR YOUR PATIENCE. IF WE CAN DO TWO ASPECTS THAT I THINK WOULD BE HELPFUL, I THINK

EVERYONE IN THIS ROOM, I KNOW MYSELF, I DON'T PRESUME TO SPEAK TO MY COLLEAGUES, I ASSUME THEY FEEL THE SAME WAY BETTER ABOUT THE PROCESS.

AF WE ACTUALLY GET A CONSULTANT WHO WORKS ON SPEC AND WILL NOT BE SPADE A PENNY OF TAXPAYER MONEY UNTIL WE GET TO THAT POINT UNTIL I THINK THERE WILL BE NO SHORTAGE OF CANDIDATES FOR THAT JOB.

IF WE GET AN ACTUAL CONSULTANT AND IF WE CONVENE THIS COMMUNITY OVERSIGHT HEARING.

WE WON'T HAVE THIS HIGHER OF COURSE WE HAVE A GOOD WORKING GROUP.

COUNCILOR WU AND MANY ADVOCATES CAN DO THIS CHECK IN AND CAN'T BE THIS FORMALIZED ANTAGONISTIC APPROACH.

YOU MAY NOT BE ABLE TO AGREE TO THOSE RIGHT NOW BUT I CERTAINLY THINK THAT'S WAIT TO AT LEAST SHOW SOME GOOD FAITH YOU'RE GOING TO DO EVERYTHING WE CAN TO MAKE SURE THIS IS CON.

DONE.

SO THAT'S MY --

[APPLAUSE]

COUNSELOR WU.

>> I WOULD PRIORITIZE THE COMMUNITY ADVISORY GROUP, WORKING GROUP FIRST BECAUSE I THINK IT'S UNDERSTANDABLE AND IT'S IN THE BEST INTEREST OF BOSTON RESIDENTS THAT YOU AND THE DEPARTMENT ARE CONCERNED ABOUT POTENTIAL IMPACTS AND COSTS AND EVERYTHING THAT WE NEED TO LOOK AT WAY DOWN THE LINE.

BUT RATHER THAN KIND OF LET THAT UNCERTAINTY PARALYZE US AND MISS OUT ON THE BENEFITS, WE HAVE PEOPLE AND INSTITUTIONS AND ORGANIZATIONS READY TO HELP AND ANSWER A LOT OF THOSE QUESTIONS. I THINK THAT'S KEY TO GETTING THAT GROUP GOING EVEN BEFORE THE CONSULTANT AND HOPEFULLY IN QUICK SUCCESSION BUT THAT NEEDS TO HAPPEN IN TERMS OF THE

CONSULTANT FEES AND NEGOTIATING
THE CAP ON THE OUTER ETCETERA.
IT'S ALL DOABLE.

I JUST WANT TO ASK A LITTLE BIT
ABOUT THE STAFFING, THE
ENVIRONMENT DEPARTMENT.
HOW MANY PEOPLE ARE IN THE
OFFICE?

>> I BELIEVE TWIN 30 AND 40.
>> ACROSS ENVIRONMENT ALL OF
THE --

>> THAT'S THE ENVIRONMENT
DEPARTMENT EEO S INCLUDES OTHER
DEPARTMENTS.

>> OKAY, GOT IT.

OF THE 30 AND 40, WHAT ARE THE
DIFFERENT TYPES OF PROJECTS OR
KIND OF DIVISIONS OF
RESPONSIBILITIES.

>> THERE ARE FOUR PRIMARY TEAMS.
THERE'S CLIMATE AND
ENVIRONMENTAL PLANNING, WHICH
OVERSEES A LOT OF OUR WORK AND
CLIMATE CHANGE MITIGATION,
CLIMATE RESILIENCE, CLIMATE
READY BOSTON, CONSERVATION
COMMISSION AIR POLLUTION CONTROL
COMMISSION ZERO WASTE BOSTON
PROCESS AND OTHERS.

WE HAVE THE ENERGY POLICY AND
PROGRAMS DIVISION WHICH INCLUDES
OUR MUNICIPAL ENERGY PROCUREMENT
PROCESSES, ETCETERA AS WELL AS
OTHER ENERGY POLICY PROGRAMS AND
THEN WE HAVE HISTORIC
PRESERVATION.

WHICH INCLUDES THE LANDMARKS
COMMISSIONS ETCETERA AND WE HAVE
GREENER BOSTON WHICH IS OUR
DEDICATED OUTREACH PROGRAM.

>> ABOUT HOW MANY PEOPLE ARE IN
EACH OF THOSE TEAMS ROUGHLY
WOULD YOU ESTIMATE.

>> VERY ROUGHLY THERE ARE ABOUT
NINE AND CLIMATE AND
ENVIRONMENTAL PLANNING.
FIVE OR SO IN ENERGY POLICY AND
PROGRAMS.

THREE IN DEDICATED GREEN DEBATE
AND THE REMAINDER IN INNOVATION
AND HISTORIC PRESERVATION.

>> OKAY.

IS THERE A LOT OF TURNOVER
RECENTLY.

>> THERE'S ALWAYS TURNOVER IN AN APARTMENT.

WE'RE ALWAYS EXCITED TO HAVE NEW PEOPLE AS WELL AS PEOPLE WITH EXPERIENCE.

>> ALL OF THE POSITIONS ARE CURRENTLY FILLED FOR LET'S SAY THE FIRST TWO CLIMATE AND ENVIRONMENTAL PLANNING AND ENERGY POLICY AND PROGRAMS.

>> WE HAVE ALL OF THE PRIMARY POSITIONS ARE CURRENTLY FULL. WE HAVE SOME TURNOVER WITH GRANT FUNDED POSITIONS.

>> I'M JUST TRYING TO UNDERSTAND KIND OF THE CAPACITY --

>> ABSOLUTELY.

WE HAVE SOME WITH THE NEW FISCAL FY19 REQUESTS WE'LL HAVE SOME SOON TO BE OPEN POSITIONS BUT WE'LL TALK ABOUT IT AT 3:00 P.M.

>> OKAY.

AND DO YOU THINK THAT SO CCU WOULD FALL UNDER WHICH ONE, ENERGY POLICY AND PROGRAMS.

>> IT WOULD LIKELY BE A COMBINATION OF MULTIPLE DEPARTMENTS WORKING ON IT. SO GREEN -- WORKS WITH OUTREACH WE COLLABORATE CLOSELY AND EEOC WOULD BE ENERGY POLICY AND ENVIRONMENTAL PLANNING TOGETHER.

>> RIGHT NOW WHO WITHIN THE STRUCTURE WOULD BE THE EITHER COORDINATOR OR MAIN CONTACT FOR OUR POTENTIAL COMMUNITY WORKING GROUP ON CCE.

>> THAT'S SOMETHING WE'RE STILL EVALUATING.

>> DO YOU FEEL THERE'S ENOUGH STAFFING THAT SOMEONE WOULD BE ABLE TO PUT THIS ON THEIR PLATE OR IS IT A MATTER OF, IS THE EVALUATION MORE AROUND EVERYBODY'S SO BUSY WITH EVERYTHING ELSE CARBON FREE BOSTON AND PLASTIC BAGS AND THE CONFERENCE THAT'S COMING UP.

>> SO THE MAYOR HAS REQUESTED FOR FY19 SUPPORT FOR PARTICULAR CULL ATTACK -- TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE AND THIS WOULD BE PICKED UP BY A NUMBER OF PEOPLE IN THE TEAM TOGETHER.

>> WHAT DO YOU MEAN BY TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE.
>> FOR IMPLEMENTATION.
SPECIFICALLY THE FY19 REQUEST.
>> THAT'S A POSITION OR JUST FUNDING FOR EXTERNAL CONTACT.
>> DETERMINED WHAT THE RIGHT ALLOCATION OF THOSE RESOURCES IS.
>> IS IT THE --
>> 98,000.
>> BUT NOT FOR NOT NECESSARILY FOR AN ADDITIONAL ROLL.
>> THAT'S SOMETHING THAT WE WOULD DETERMINE IN THE NEAR FUTURE WHAT THE RIGHT ALLOCATION OF THOSE RESOURCES ARE.
>> HOW WOULD YOU START MAKING THAT DECISION, DOES IT DEPEND ON ANY OF THE HISTORICAL PRICING INFORMATION THAT YOU NEED.
>> YES.
IT WOULD INVOLVE THAT, IT WOULD INVOLVE THE OUTCOMES FROM CARBON FREE BOSTON, THE ALLOCATION OF RESOURCES OF THE GREEN JOVATE AND OTHER THINGS.
>> DO YOU USE THAT AFTER CARBON FREE BOSTON IS DONE.
>> IT'S POTENTIALLY DEPENDING ON WHETHER WE GET HISTORICAL PRICING BEFORE THAT.
>> YOU SAID THAT CARBON FREE BOSTON WOULD BE DUE BACK SOMETIME IN THE FALL.
SO WE'RE NEAR HALFLY THROUGH THE FISCAL YEAR AT THAT POINT TO USE UP THE FUNDING.
>> SO JUST MAKING -- DO YOUR KNOWLEDGE COMMUNICATED WITH THE DEPARTMENT ON HAVING A POSITION ON CCE.
>> THAT'S SOMETHING I DON'T HAVE INFORMATION ON BUT I COULD GET IT FOR YOU.
>> THEY ARE RECENT ME IN CONTACT WITH EACH OF THESE FOUR OR THE FIRST TWO CLIMATE ENVIRONMENT PLANNING AND ENERGY POLICY AND PROGRAMS SO REGULARLY IN TOUCH WITH YOU ALL.
>> THEY ARE REGULARLY IN TOUCH WITH US.
>> DO YOU HAVE A SENSE OF HOW

THEY WOULD, WHETHER THEY WOULD HAVE A POSITION ON CCE OR HAVE ANY STAKE IN THIS.

DO YOU HAVE A SENSE WHETHER EVERY SOURCE WOULD HAVE A POSITION ON CCE OR HAVE ANY STAKE IN THIS.

>> THAT'S SOMETHING I DON'T HAVE INFORMATION ON.

>> OKAY.

SO I JUST I GUESS I WANT TO REITERATE COUNCILOR O'MALLEY'S TWO POINTS WITH THE COMMITTEE AND WITH THE CONSULTANT, BUT THE 98,000 FUNDING WHICH IS A GREAT THING AND I WILL BE VERY HAPPY TO VOTE FOR THAT.

I THINK WE NEED A LOT MORE CLARITY ON HOW THAT WOULD BE USED AND MOST IMPORTANTLY WHETHER IT COULD BE USED RIGHT AWAY WAITING UNTIL AFTER CARBON FREE BOSTON TO FIGURE OUT EVEN IF THAT'S FUNDING FOR OPERATIONS OR FUNDING FOR A POSITION IS CONCERNED BECAUSE IT'S HALF DONE AT THAT POINT.

>> JUST TO CLARIFY WE'RE EVALUATING RIGHT NOW WHAT THE NEXT STEPS ARE AND WHAT THE RIGHT ALLOCATION IS.

>> WHY WAS THE 98,000 FIGURE CHOSEN I'M JUST CURIOUS.

>> AGAIN I HAVE TO GET BACK TO YOU ON THAT ONE.

>> OKAY, THANK YOU.

>> THANK YOU, COUNCILOR WU.

SO I THINK NOW I'M GOING TO GET TO PUBLIC TESTIMONY UNLESS ANYONE HAS ANY SORT OF CONCLUDING REMARKS.

WE'LL START WITH YOU AND GO ALL THE WAY DOWN.

>> YES.

I ACTUALLY WANTED TO TALK ABOUT THE HISTORICAL DATA PIECES.

>> CORRECT.

>> I WORRIED THAT MIGHT BE AN UNNECESSARY OBSTACLE TO EVALUATING CLEAN ENERGY IN BOSTON.

WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE CLEAN ENERGY MARKET THE COST OF SOLAR POWER FREQUENT HAS GONE DOWN

OVER 10% PER YEAR OVER THE LAST
TEN YEARS.

IT'S A DYNAMIC MARKET.

IF YOU LOOK AT WIND POWER WE
DON'T HAVE ANY OFF THE COAST OF
MASSACHUSETTS BUT WE JUST
ANNOUNCED A CONTRACT FOR 800
MEGAWATTS OFATE.

THIS IS A LANDSCAPE THAT'S
CHANGING VERY QUICKLY.

RENEWABLE ENERGY IS CHANGING
VERY QUICKLY.

THAT'S WHY YOU'RE SEEING CORP.
UPDATE AROUND THE COUNTRY AND
THE WORLD FOR RENEWABLE ENERGY.
THE CASES ARE CHANGING VERY
QUICKLY.

I CAUTION THAT PERHAPS LOOKING
AT HISTORICAL DATA MAY NOT BE A
GOOD REFLECTION OF THE
OPPORTUNITIES HERE LOCALLY TO
BUILD A CLEAN ENERGY ECONOMY AND
BENEFIT CONSUMERS OF BOSTON.

>> THAT MAKES A LOT OF SENSE TO
ME.

[APPLAUSE]

>> I'M GOING TO SAY THE SAME
THING IN A DIFFERENT WAY.

>> OKAY.

>> HISTORICAL ENERGY PRICES ARE
IN NO WAY A GOOD INDICATOR OF
FUTURE ENERGY PRICES.

IT'S WHAT THE CITY OF BOSTON IS
TRYING TO FIND IS WHAT WILL THIS
PROGRAM COST IN THE FUTURE GOING
FORWARD THEN FIGURING OUT WHAT
IT WOULD HAVE COST LAST YEAR IS
NOT GOING TO HELP WITH THAT.
OR NOT AS MUCH AS OTHER THINGS
WOULD.

THERE ARE OTHER GOOD METHODS
FROM LOOKING FORWARD TO FIND OUT
GOOD PREDICTIONS OF ENERGY
PRICES GOING FORWARD BUT LAST
YEAR'S PRICES ISN'T ONE OF THEM.

>> THANK YOU.

ANY CONCLUDING REMARKS?

>> THANK YOU.

>> THANK YOU.

IF YOU'RE ABLE I KNOW YOU GUYS
HAVE BUSY SCHEDULES BUT THANK
YOU FOR THAT.

IF YOU'RE ABLE TO STAY IN HERE
AND HEAR SOME OF THE PUBLIC

TESTIMONY I WOULD REALLY APPRECIATE IT.
WE HAVE QUITE A FEW PEOPLE.
I'M GOING TO ASK EVERYONE TO PLEASE KEEP TO TWO MINUTE LIMIT.
I WILL VERY GENERALLY TYPE MY MIC WHEN YOUR TWO MINUTES IS UP.
I'M GOING TO READ THREE.
YOU CAN LINE UP AT EITHER OF THE TWO MICROPHONES IN FRONT OF THE PANEL.

SO FIRST IS INDIANA
[INDISCERNIBLE] OR EUGENE AWE GIBBONS, EITHER OF THOSE TWO.
MICHELLE BROOKS AND CRYSTAL ANEKE.

APOLOGIES FOR MISPRONOUNCING THAT.

>> CAN YOU HEAR ME?

>> YES.

>> OKAY.

SO GOOD AFTERNOON CHAIRMAN O'MALLEY, COUNCILORS WU AND FLYNN.

THANK YOU FOR THIS OPPORTUNITY TO COMMENT TODAY.

MY NAME IS INDIANA
[INDISCERNIBLE] AND I'M A PROGRAM ASSOCIATE AT MASS ENERGY CONSUMER'S ALLIANCE.

WE'RE A BOSTON BASED NON-PROFIT WORKING TO MAKE ENERGY MORE AFFORDABLE AND SUSTAINABLE SINCE OUR FOUNDING IN 1982 AND OUR COMMISSION IS TO HARNESS THE COLLECTIVE POWER OF ENERGY CONSUMERS TO ACCELERATE THE TRANSITION FOR LOW CARBON FUTURE.

SO WITH THAT, WE ARE STRONG SUPPORTERS OF MUNICIPAL AGGREGATION BECAUSE IT OFFERS AN ALTERNATIVE TO COMPETITIVE SUPPLIERS AND TO BASIC SERVICE. MASS ENERGY RELEASED A REPORT ON GREEN LIMITS AGGREGATION.

I JUST GAVE OUT SOME OF THE EXECUTIVE SUMMARIES YOU COULD READ ABOUT THE SUCCESSES WE'VE SEEN SO FAR.

SO BASICALLY AGGREGATION RESTORES TRANSPARENCY TO THE ENERGY PURCHASING PROCESS BY OFFERING COMMUNITY MEMBERS A

WELL VETTED PRODUCT AND ABILITY
TO OPT OUT AT ANY TIME WITHOUT
PENALTY.

WITH THIS IN MIND, WE THANK YOU
AND YOUR COLLEAGUES ON THE CITY
COUNCIL FOR UNANIMOUSLY PASSING
AN AUTHORIZATION LAST OCTOBER
FOR CCE.

WE THANK MAYOR WALSH FOR THIS
ENDORSEMENT OF THE AUTHORIZATION
AND IN DOING SO, THIS WILL BE AN
IMPORTANT FIRST STEP IN MOVING
THE CITY CLOSER TO PARTICIPATING
IN ELECTRIC AGGREGATION FOR
RESIDENTS.

WITHIN RENEWABLE ENERGY.
AND THIN FINALLY WE ALSO LIKE TO
THANK THE STAFF OF THE
ENVIRONMENT ENERGY OPEN SPACE
FOR THEIR TESTIMONY ABOUT
PROGRESS TO DATE AND THE
IMPLEMENTATION OF THIS ORDER.
WE UNDERSTAND THE IMPORTANCE OF
GETTING THE DETAILS RIGHT BUT
ALSO CAUTION THE PERFECTION TO
BECOME THE ION ME OF GOOD.

WITH REGARD TO HIGGINS TORQUE
PRICING, IT IS IMPOSSIBLE TO
RELY ON ANY PRICE INFORMATION
HISTORIC OR OTHERWISE TO
ACCURATELY INFORM AN AGGREGATION
THAT ISN'T LIKELY TO START
WITHIN A YEAR OR MORE.

ONE PURPOSE OF AGGREGATION IS TO
HARNESS THE BULK PURCHASING
POWER OF THE COMMUNITY TO
DELIVER SAVINGS TO RESIDENTS IN
SMALL BUSINESSES AND BOSTON'S
GREATEST ASSET IS ITS SIZE AND
THAT SHOULD BE USED TO ITS
ADVANTAGE.

A QUALIFIED CONSULTANT WOULD
GUIDE THE CITY ON MATTERS OF
THIS AND OF COURSE WITH WELL FFD
STAKEHOLDERS HELPING AS WELL.

>> THANK YOU.

HOW MUCH MORE DO YOU HAVE?
I JUST WANT TO BE FAIR TO
EVERYBODY.

>> I'LL WRAP IT UP QUICKLY.
TO ACT NOW CLIMATE CHANGE AND
THE CITY OF BOSTON CAN'T WAIT.
LET'S START WRITING THE PLANS
SETTING PUBLIC INPUT, GETTING

BPA APPROVAL AND PUTTING IT OUT
TO BID.
>> THANK YOU INDIANA.
MICHELLE BROOKS, WELCOME.
>> GOOD AFTERNOON.
MY NAME IS MICHELLE BROOKS AND I
SERVE AS THE BOSTON -- YOU DON'T
HAVE TO TRACK EVERYTHING.
SOMETIME IT WILL TAKE A OR SO.
>> GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS
MICHELLE BROOKS AND I SERVE AS
THE BOSTON COMMUNITY CHAPTER OF
THE SIERRA CLUB.
I'M SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF OUR
10,000 MEMBERS SUPPORTIVE OF THE
CITY OF BOSTON TO EXPRESS OUR
DEEP CONCERN AND FRUSTRATION THE
DELAY OF THE IMPLEMENTATION OF
COMMUNITY CHOICE ENERGY.
THE CITY'S ENVIRONMENT
DEPARTMENT HAS TAKEN AN
UNTRADITIONAL APPROACH BY
ISSUING AN RFI AFTER THE CITY
COUNCIL UNANIMOUSLY VOTED LAST
OCTOBER TO AUTHORIZE CCE.
IT WAS STATED IN THE RFI THAT
PARTICIPATION WAS NOT A
REQUIREMENT IN ORDER TO PARTNER
WITH THE CITY ON THIS EFFORT.
ENERGY BROKERS OFTEN INCLUDE
THIS INFORMATION IN THEIR SAME
OLD BID TO THE MUNICIPALITY OR
AN INFORMAL SESSION PRIOR TO THE
RELEASE OF THE RFP.
USING THIS AS A REASON, CCE
ENTERED THE CARBON FREE BOSTON
STEADY WHICH WON'T FINISH UNTIL
LATE OCTOBER 2018 IS
DENYING RESIDENTS OF THE CITY
THE OPPORTUNITY TO REACH THE
BENEFITS OF CCE RIGHT NOW.
WHICH HAS PROVEN TO BE THE
SINGLE MOST EFFECTIVE WAY FOR
MUNICIPALITIES TO AGGREGATE
THEIR ELECTRICITY AND TO
STABILIZE RATES AND INCREASE
ACCESS TO RENEWABLE ENERGY FOR
RESIDENT OF ALL INCOMES.
THERE HAVE BEEN MANY STUDIES
DONE TO SHOW THIS.
WE DON'T NEED TO SPEND ANOTHER
STUDY EFFECTIVENESS.
YOU DON'T HAVE TIME TO WASTE.
THE CITY IS NOT ON TRACK TO MEET

ITS GOAL AS CARBON EMISSIONS BY
25% OF THE YEAR 2020.
AND WE KNOW THAT IMPLEMENTING
CCE CAN HELP US GET THE RIGHT.
I UNCH THE CITY OF BOSTON TO DO
EVERYTHING IN ITS POWER TO SEE
THROUGH IMPLEMENTATION OF THIS
PROGRAM IN A TIMELY MANNER.
I WANT TO THANK THE CITY COUNCIL
FOR THERE TIME.

>> THANK YOU, MICHELLE.

THANK YOU.

[APPLAUSE]

>> CRYSTAL IS NEXT FOLLOWED BY
RICKY HARVEY AND SARAH FREEMAN.

>> HELLO.

THANK YOU FOR HAVING ME HERE
TODAY.

MY NAME IS CRYSTAL

[INDISCERNIBLE] AND A RECENT
GRADUATE [INDISCERNIBLE].

I'M A [INDISCERNIBLE] I'M HERE
FOR SUPPORT OF THE COMMUNITY
CHOICE ENERGY POLICY.

THE REASON I DO IS BECAUSE I'M A
PRODUCT OF IMMIGRANTS.

MY PARENTS AREN'T FULLY UPDATED
ON THE OPPORTUNITIES ENERGY WILL
HAVE ON OUR LIVES.

THAT'S REPRESENTATIVE OF THE
[INDISCERNIBLE] ENERGY BROKERS.

KNOWING THAT, CCE, I DON'T
UNDERSTAND THE HESITATION.

I DON'T UNDERSTAND WHY IT'S
NOT -- IF WE HAD THE OPPORTUNITY
TO DO THIS, LIKE WHY

[INDISCERNIBLE].

THEY DO DENY CLIMATE CHANGE ON
POLICIES [INDISCERNIBLE] I SEE
WHAT THE EFFECT IT HAS IN OTHER
COUNTRIES.

[INDISCERNIBLE] OF THIS NATURE,
IT'S JUST SHOCKING TO ME THAT
THEY'RE NOT TAKING ADVANTAGE OF
THIS.

IT'S SHOCKING TO ME THAT THE
OFFICIALS AREN'T [INDISCERNIBLE]
I HOPE TODAY THAT THIS POLICY
WOULD BE ONE OF THE FACTORS THAT
CAN INCREASE CLIMATE THINGS THAT
ARE CURRENT LIKE THE KIND OF
THINGS THAT ARE CURRENT IN OUR
COUNTRY TODAY.

>> THANK YOU VERY MUCH, CRYSTAL.

THANK YOU.

RICKY HARVEY, SARAH FREEMAN AND
JOE [INDISCERNIBLE]

>> I'M GOING TO SKIP THE BULK OF
MINE BECAUSE MICHELLE COVERED IT
VERY WELL AND GET RIGHT TO THE
POINT.

IT IS JUST COMMON SENSE THAT
AGGRAVATIONS HAVE THE ABILITY TO
NEGOTIATE BETTER RATES SINCE
THERE ARE MORE CUSTOMERS.

WHILE THERE'S NO GUARANTEE THAT
AGGRAVATIONS WILL SAVE MONEY,
THEY HAVE MORE FLEXIBILITY WHEN
THEY PROCURE.

FOR AN AGGREGATION ALL OF BOSTON
RHESUS TENTS WOULDN'T THERE BE A
PRETTY GOOD CHANCE THAT A BROKER
COULD NEGOTIATE BETTER RATES FOR
US EVEN WITH AN INCREASE OF 5%
RENEWABLES.

WHY NOT START WITH THE PROCESS
AND SEE WHAT RATES WE ARE
OFFERED.

WHILE WE APPRECIATE ALL OF US
BEING HERE THIS MORNING, IT IS
PROFOUNDLY DISAPPOINTING THAT
THE CHIEF OF THE MEYER'S
DEPARTMENT WOULD NOT ATTEND
TODAY'S HEARING AND ANSWER THE
COUNCIL'S QUESTIONS ABOUT THE
LACK OF THE IMPLEMENTATION
PROCESS.

IT IS ONE MORE EXAMPLE OF THE
RAPID LEADERSHIP ON IMPORTANT
ENVIRONMENTAL INITIATIVES FROM
EEO S.

IT IS ONE MORE EXAMPLE OF EEO S
LISTENING TO OTHER SOURCES THAN
THE RESIDENTS OF BOSTON.

IT IS ONE MORE OF THE EEO S NOT
LIST INK.

THIS LEADS TO ONE QUESTION, WHY
DOES MAYOR WALSH CONTINUE TO LET
THIS HAPPEN.

[APPLAUSE]

>> THANK YOU.

SARAH FREEMAN, JOE AND ANDY.

>> HELLO EVERYBODY I'M SARAH
FREEMAN FROM JAMAICA PLAINS AND
ON BEHALF OF THE URBAN WACO
LITTLE WHO IN GENERAL IS GOOD
FOR THE ENVIRONMENT AND I THINK
IT'S PRETTY OPEN AND SHUT THAT

CCE IS THE SINGLE MOST EFFECTIVE
STEP THE CITY COULD TAKE.

I ECHO WHAT HAS BEEN SAID BEFORE
AND IN JUST TEMPORARILY LOOKING
AT THE PROS AND CONS, IT REMINDS
ME THE PROCESS, REMINDS ME OF A
QUOTE FROM A FELLOW JP RESIDENT
YEARS AGO THAT PROCESSED FEELS
MORE IMPORTANT THAN THE PRODUCT
AND IT'S LIKE NO ONE WANTS THE
CITY TO RUSH HEAD LONG INTO A
BAD DEAL BUT I THINK PEOPLE NEED
TO FEEL THAT WE'RE ON A PATH
THAT'S GETTING TO A PRODUCT
SOONER RATHER THAN LATER.

AND THE AMOUNT OF RESEARCH WOULD
BE THE SAME NOW OR SIX MONTHS
FROM NOW SO I THINK WE ALL NEED
TO FEEL THAT IT'S A REAL
PRIORITY NOT ACADEMIC RESEARCH
PROJECT.

I'LL CLOSE WITH A VERY SMALL
QUOTE FROM THE GLOBE WITHIN THE
PAST WEEK.

THE HEADLINE IS O'MALLEY CUTS
THE CLIMATE CHANGE ACTION.
I THINK THEY SHOULD REVISE IT TO
TWO O'MALLEYS BECAUSE THE
O'MALLEY HERE IS CARDINAL SEAN
P. O'MALLEY AND I'LL READ A
LITTLE BIT OF THIS AND THEN
LEAVE IT FOR THE RECORD.

THE ROMAN CATHOLIC ARCH BIRVE UP
OF -- BISHOP OF BOSTON LED
HUNDREDS OF LOCAL LEADERS AND
SCIENTISTS APPEALING FOR ACTION
ON CLIMATE CHANGE.

O'MALLEY WAS AMONG THE
SIGNATORIES TO ENDORSE AND
APPEAL CALLING FOR THE CLIMATE
CRISES TO BE ADDRESSED.

QUOTE, WITH THE BOLDNESS AND
URGENCY WITH SUBSTANTIVE AND
IMMEDIATE ACTION.

CLIMATE CHANGE IS AN HE CAN
LODGE CAN CULL AND MORAL
EMERGENCY BUT IMPACTS ALL OTHER
ASPECTS OF SHARED LIVES AND
REQUIRES US TO WORK TOGETHER TO
PROTECT OUR COMMON HOMES.
CAN'T SAY IT ANY BETTER THAN
THAT.

THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO
COME.

[APPLAUSE]

>> THANK YOU, SARAH.

DO YOU WANT THIS?

>> YES.

THANK YOU, SARAH.

SHANE WILL TAKE IT FROM YOU.

JOE, ANDY AND BEN.

>> GOOD AFTERNOON.

MY NAME IS JOE [INDISCERNIBLE]

AND I'M A 2017 BOSTON PUBLIC
SCHOOLS GRADUATE.

I'M ON THE BOSTON ADVISORY
COUNCIL YOUTH ON BOARD -- BOSTON
COLLEGE AND MOST IMPORTANTLY A
RESIDENT OF BOSTON.

I RECOGNIZE ON YOU ION FLUENTIAL
COMMUNITY CHOICE ENERGY CAN BE
IN REGARDS TO REDUCING OUR
CARBON FOOTPRINT AND COMBATING
CLOIFNL CHANGE AND THAT IS EVER
IMPORTANT IN THE COASTAL CITY.
THE TERRIBLE EFFECTS OF MAJOR
STORMS DUE TO CLIMATE CHANGE HAS
BOMBARDED OUR MEDIA WITH
HORRIFIC IMAGES OF TRAGEDY AFTER
TRAGEDY.

WHILE WE ARE LUCKY ENOUGH TO NOT
HAVE HAD ANY OF THOSE STORMS
HEAVILY AFFECT OUR CITIES IN
PARTICULAR, THAT CAN CHANGE IF
WE DO NOT COMBAT CLIMATE CHANGE
HEAD ON.

THIS IS EXACTLY WHY WE NEED TO
IMPLEMENT COMMUNITY CHOICE
ENERGY.

AS A YOUNG PERSON WHO HAS BEEN
BORN AND RAISED IN BOSTON
THINKING ABOUT THE POSSIBLE
NEGATIVE EFFECTS CLIMATE CHANGE
COULD HAVE ON MY CITY SCARES ME.
IT SCARES ME EVEN MORE BECAUSE
THOSE EFFECTS AREN'T ONLY A
POSSIBILITY, RESEARCH HAS SHOWN
WE WILL BE MORE VULNERABLE TO
MAJOR [INDISCERNIBLE] IF WE DO
NOT ADDRESS CLIMATE CHANGE RIGHT
NOW.

THAT'S WHY CCE NEEDS TO BEGIN TO
PROTECT OUR RESIDENTS AS
POSSIBLE.

AMONG MANY OTHERS, WE WATCH
ENTIRE COMMUNITIES BE DESTROYED
AND THOSE PLACES WILL NEVER BE
THE SAME AGAIN.

WE HAVE TO TAKE ACTION ON OUR
CARBON FOOTPRINT.
WE CAN DO OUR PART TO HELP
PREVENT CATASTROPHIC STORMS THAT
ARE AFFECTING OUR PEOPLE BY
USING CLEAN ENERGY.
THAT'S WHAT WE SHOULD DO.
THANK YOU CITY COUNCIL.

[APPLAUSE]

>> THANK YOU, JOE.

CAN I JUST SAY ONE OF THE GREAT
BENEFITS OF MY JOB IS NOW HAVING
BEEN IN OFFICE FOR EIGHT YEARS,
I'VE WORKED WITH -- FROM DAY ONE
AND I'VE SEEN SO MANY MEN AND
WOMEN THAT GO THROUGH
INVOLVEMENT WITH THAT
PARTICULARLY ON ENVIRONMENT
ISSUES AND I JUST HAVE TO SAY
JOE, YOU AND YOUR COLLEAGUES ARE
SUCH A CREDIT TO THIS CITY AND
YOU GIVE ME SUCH HOPE FOR OUR
FUTURE.

SO THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

>> THANK YOU SO MUCH, SIR.

>> ANDY BEAN AND THEN

[INDISCERNIBLE]

>> HI, IF IT'S OKAY WITH YOU, I
WOULD LIKE TO PASS IT OFF TO
THIS GENTLEMAN.

>> AREN'T YOU KIND.

THANK YOU.

YES, THANK YOU.

>> MY NAME IS DAVID, THIS IS MY
SON [INDISCERNIBLE].

HE'S ANOTHER YOUNG PERSON WHO
WILL BE AWE FISHED BY CITEMENT
CHANGE LONG AFTER I'M GONE AND
MANY OF US ARE GONE.

AND I JUST WANT TO BRING TO OUR
ATTENTION THAT THE FOCUS ON
PRESENT UTILITY BILLS AND THE
INCREASING COST OF COMMUNITY
CHOICE ENERGY SEEMS VERY
SHORTSIGHTED GIVEN THE EFFECTS
OF CLIMATE CHANGE ON OUR
COMMUNITY, ON BOSTON, ON THE
LIVE BILLITY OF BOSTON AND THE
LIVEABILITY OF OUR PLANET.

SO I JUST WANT TO REINFORCE THE
URGENCY OF THIS AND I ENCOURAGE
ALL PEOPLE INVOLVED TO LIMIT
THESE DELAYS AND MOVE FORWARD ON
THIS.

THANK YOU.

>> THANK YOU DAVID, APPRECIATE IT.

ANDY, WE'RE GOING TO TAKE YOU NOW SINCE THAT WAS VERY KIND.

>> MY NAME IS ANDY BEAN, I WORK WITH BOSTON CLIMATE ACTION NETWORK.

AND THE FIRST THING, THE CONTEXT FOR THIS HEARING IS THAT BOSTON IS NOT ON TRACK.

WE HAVE SET GOALS AROUND CLIMATE CHANGE GREENHOUSE GAS SOLUTION REDUCTION.

BY 2020 WE WANT TO HAVE A 25% REDUCTION.

AS OF THE DATA THAT I DUG OUT OF THE EUS BUDGET, WE HAD A REDUCTION OF 12% LAST YEAR.

WE'RE LESS THAN HALFWAY THERE AND WE'VE GOT NOT MUCH TIME LEFT.

NOW, CCE IS A WAY TO ALMOST OVERNIGHT HAVE A HUGE IMPACT ON OUR GREENHOUSE GAS POLLUTION.

IT'S A WAY WE CAN DO THAT WITHOUT MAJOR EXPENDITURE.

WE'RE ALL HERE IT'S NOT BECAUSE WE ARE [INDISCERNIBLE] TOWARDS LIKE UTILITY STRUCTURE.

WE DON'T CARE ABOUT WHERE THE ELECTRICITY OR WHAT STRUCTURES ARE BROUGHT N WE CARE ABOUT ACTING ON CLIMATE AND PRESERVING THIS WORLD FOR THE NEXT GENERATION.

AND THE RELUCTANCE AND THE DESPERATE LACK OF URGENCY FROM THE MAYOR'S OFFICE AND FROM EEUS IS GOLFING AND THAT'S WHAT GOT SO MANY OUT IN THE MIDDLE OF THE WORKDAY AND MANY OF US TAKING OFF TO BE HERE TO SAY WE APPRECIATE THE WORK THAT THE CITY COUNCIL'S BEEN DOING.

THEY'VE DONE THE HOMEWORK, THEY'VE TALKED TO STAKE HOARDS. THEY GET IT.

WE NEAT TO ACT ON CLIMB AND CUT ON THE CARBON SOLUTION AND WE WANT THE MAYOR AND HIS ADMINISTRATION TO DO THE SAME. THANK YOU.

>> THANK YOU ANDY.

[APPLAUSE]

>> I THINK [INDISCERNIBLE] BEN,
JACQUELINE IS NEXT.

AFTER JACQUELINE, KEN.

YES OR NO?

NO.

OKAY.

KEVIN AND THEN LEE HUMPHREY.

BEN I THINK HE LEFT, OKAY.

JACQUELINE, KEVIN AND THEN LEE.

>> MY NAME IS JACQUELINE SECTOR
AND I LIVE IN JAMAICA PLAINS
WITH MY HUSBAND AND MY TWO YOUNG
CHILDREN WHO IS 15 MONTHS AND
TWO AND-A-HALF.

THEY'RE IN SCHOOL TODAY AND
COULDN'T BE HERE.

I'M A VOLUNTEER WITH MOTHERS
[INDISCERNIBLE] IT COMES AS NO
SURPRISE I'M CONCERNED ABOUT MY
CHILDREN'S FUTURE AND ALL
CHILDREN'S FUTURE.

I THINK WE NEED TO GET REAL AND
NOTE IT'S NOT JUST ABOUT
[INDISCERNIBLE] BECAUSE CLIMATE
CHANGE IS HAPPENING NOW.

WE'RE SEEING IT LOCALLY, WE'RE
SEEING IT NATIONALLY AND WE'RE
SEEK IT ALL OVER THE WORLD.

WHETHER IT'S CATASTROPHIC
HURRICANES, FLOODING, ONGOING
RELENTLESS FLOOD PATTERNS
CLIMATE CHANGE HAS

[INDISCERNIBLE] IT IS HAPPENING
RIGHT HERE AND RIGHT NOW AND IT
AFFECTS ALL OF US PARTICULARLY
VULNERABLE COMMUNITIES.

BUT I DON'T THINK I NEED TO
CONVINCE ANYONE OF THAT HERE.

LAST YEAR THE BOSTON CITY
COUNCIL UNANIMOUSLY VIDEOED TO
PASS [INDISCERNIBLE] IT WAS
EXCITED AND I WAS PROUD OF
BOSTON AND I FELT PROUD TO BE A
RZ DENT OF BOSTON.

[INDISCERNIBLE] RELEASE BECAUSE
WE KNOW THAT COMMUNITY CHOICE
ENERGY IS A CRITICAL STEP
TOWARDS MITIGATING THE WORST
EFFECTS OF CLIMATE CHANGE.
EVERY SINGLE THING THAT WE DO IN
IMPLEMENTING THE [INDISCERNIBLE]
SO I THANK YOU SO MUCH TODAY FOR
HOLDING THIS HEARING AND THANK

YOU FOR PASSING COMMUNITY CHOICE ENERGY AND URGE THE CITY TO IMPLEMENT IT AS SOON AS POSSIBLE.

WE JUST DON'T HAVE TIME TO DELAY.

>> THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

[APPLAUSE]

>> KEVIN, IS KEVIN HERE?

OKAY.

MR. HUMPHREY, YOU ARE NEXT FOLLOWED BY RYAN AND THEN CAM WILSON.

>> MY NAME'S LEE HUMPHREY AND I'M A MEMBER OF THE GREEN COMMUNITY OF THE BACK DAY AND THE BOSTON CLEAN ENERGY COALITION.

I'M HERE TO APPEARED INDICATE ADOPTING CCE WHICH HAS MANY JUSTIFICATIONS BUT IN ADDITION TO THESE JUSTIFICATIONS, THE REASON IT IS IMPORTANT IS THAT IT WILL COUNTERACT SOME OF THE DISAPPOINTMENTS IN SOME OF THE ENVIRONMENTAL AREAS.

THERE ARE TWO I'M ESPECIALLY FAMILIAR WITH, BOSTON'S CLIMATE ACTION PLAN AND BOSTON GAS RATE. WHAT'S GOING ON WITH BOSTON CLIMATE ACTION PLAN?

THE GOAL IS TO REDUCE THE EMISSIONS, THE 2005 EMISSIONS BY 25% BY 2020.

AND SO FAR WE REDUCED EMISSIONS AS OF 2015 BY 13%.

THIS MEANS WE HAVE TO REDUCE THE NEXT FIVE YEARS BY 12%.

IS THAT LIKELY?

NO.

PARTICULARLY SINCE THE LAST YEAR THAT EMISSIONS WENT DOWN WAS IN 2012.

IN 2013, 2014 AND 2015 EMISSIONS WENT UP.

AND THEN IT WAS ALL CONSTRUCTION.

THERE ARE THREE CATEGORY OF BUILDINGS THAT ARE PRESENTLY BEFORE THE BPBA.

THOSE UNDER REVIEW, THOSE THAT HAVE BEEN APPROVED AND THOSE THAT ARE ON ARE CONSTRUCTION.

THAT AMOUNTS OVER 90 MILLION

SQUARE FEET.
AND THERE'S NOTHING I'VE SEEN
THAT INDICATES THE NEW BUILDINGS
ARE GOING TO BE ANY MORE
EFFICIENT THAN THE EXISTING
BUILDINGS.

SO WHAT THAT MEANS IS THAT THE
EMISSIONS FROM THE NEW BUILDINGS
WILL BE AN INSOLUBLE PLUG THAT
WILL BE WITH US FOR YEARS.

A DISAPPOINTING BOTTOM LINE WE
ARE PROBABLY GOING TO MISS OUR
2020 EMISSIONS GOAL

SUBSTANTIALLY.

I THINK THIS IS BEING REALIZED
BECAUSE NO ONE TALKS ANYMORE
ABOUT 2020.

WE'RE NOW TALKING ABOUT 2050 IN
REDUCTION OF 80%.

BUT THAT'S 32 YEARS AWAY.

SO GOING TO THE GAS LAKES IN
EACH OF THE LAST THREE YEARS THE
NUMBER OF GAS LAKES INCREASED.

METHANE, A GREENHOUSE GAS THAT'S
MORE POWERFUL THAN THE HEAT
TRAPPING CAPABILITIES AS CARBON
DIOXIDE.

IT'S NO LONGER NATURAL GAS, IT'S
FRACK GAS.

IT CONTAINS A LOT OF HARMFUL
CHEMICALS LIKE [INDISCERNIBLE]
AND FORMALDEHYDE.

PEOPLE HAVE PROBLEMS AND
PREGNANT WOMEN SHOULD STAY AWAY
FROM FRACK GAS.

>> CAN YOU WRAP IT UP.

>> CCE IS JUST A WAY TO
COUNTERACT WHAT THESE OTHER
DISAPPOINTMENTS.

>> THANK YOU.

[APPLAUSE]

>> RYAN, CAM, NELSON.

>> RYAN'S NEXT THEN CAM AND THE
NEXT IS MARY.

>> MY NAME IS RYAN GREESER.

I'M APPRECIATIVE AS A COMMUNITY
MEMBER HERE IN BOSTON I HAVE THE
OPPORTUNITY TO BE HERE TO TALK
WITH THE GROUP TODAY ABOUT THIS
ISSUE THAT WE ALL CARE A LOT
ABOUT.

I THINK IT'S VERY SPECIAL.

IT'S REALLY URGENT THAT WE WORK
ON FIGHTING CLIMATE CHANGE

BECAUSE THE EFFECTS OF HUMAN
CAUSE HISTORIC EMISSIONS HAVE
BEEN MEASURABLE AND HAVE HAD A
SEGGANT IMPACT.

I GUESS I WOULD LIKE TO RESTATE,
I'D LIKE TO SAY THAT BETWEEN
BECAUSE I DON'T BELIEVE I WAS
CLEAR WITH MY WORDS.

WORDS.

FIGHTING CLIMATE CHANGE IS
URGENT BECAUSE THE EFFECTS OF
HUMAN CAUSE HISTORIC EMISSIONS
HAS HAD A MEASURABLE SIGNIFICANT
IMPACT.

THE ELECTRICITY SECTOR ACCOUNTS
FOR ROUGHLY ONE THIRD OF ANNUAL
EMISSIONS, OF ANNUAL GREENHOUSE
GAS EMISSIONS IN THIS CITY.

THE ELECTRICITY SECTOR -- I'M
SORRY GUYS, I'M SORRY I'M NOT
PREPARED TO SPEAK.

IT'S A WAY FOR THE CITY OF
BOSTON TO SHOW LEADERSHIP TO
OTHER GOVERNMENTS, TO OTHER CITY
GOVERNMENTS AND HELP TRANSITION
OUR ENERGY SYSTEMS TO SOURCES
THAT DON'T INCREASE OUR
ATMOSPHERE GREENHOUSE GAS
CONCENTRATIONS.

AND I WANT TO SAY THANK YOU FOR
THE LEADERSHIP AND COMMITMENT ON
THIS ISSUE.

>> THANK YOU.

THANK YOU RYAN.

[APPLAUSE]

COUNCILOR WU JUST HAD TO STEP
OUT TO DEAL CAN WITH ONE OF HER
SOUNDS BUT WE'LL BE BACK.

CAM WILSON IS NEXT, THEN MARY
RUSSELL AND THEN ALAN POWELL.

>> HI, I'M CAM WILSON, I'M IN
350.ORG AND BOSTON CLIMATE
NETWORK.

WE NEED CCE NOW BECAUSE
WORLDWIDE PEOPLE ARE ALREADY
DROWNING AND DYING OF HEAT AND
WE NEED CCE NOT JUST IN BOSTON,
NOT JUST TO MEET BOSTON'S GOALS
BUT THE REASON WE HAVE THESE
GOALS IS THAT WE NEED TO BRING
EMISSIONS DOWN WORLDWIDE, DO
WHAT WE CAN TO STOP THE ATLANTIC
OCEAN CURRENT, TO KEEP THE
ATLANTIC CURRENT GOING, IT'S

SLOWING DOWN ALREADY AND IF WE
DON'T ACT NOW IT COULD STOP AND
CAUSE POSSIBLY COST ALL LIFE ON
EARTH.

THANK YOU.

>> THANK YOU, CAM.

MARY RUSSELL, ALAN POWELL, JAMES
[INDISCERNIBLE]

>> HELLO, THANK YOU.

MY NAME'S MARY RUSSELL.

I LIVE IN ROSLINDALE, I'M A
PAINTER AND I'VE BEEN PAINTING
THE DISAPPEARING THE ARCTIC ICE
CAP FOR FIVE YEARS NOW.

WE'VE ALL BEEN TALKING ABOUT
BEING REASONABLE ABOUT GOING
FORWARD.

WHAT IS REASONABLE.

WHAT ISN'T REASONABLE.

AND I WANT TO TALK ABOUT HOW
UNREASONABLE IT IS FOR US NOT TO
GO COMPLETELY OUTSIDE OF OUR
EVERY DAY ACTIVITIES IN THIS
PROCESS.

IT'S DIFFICULT TO MIDGE THE
SITUATION THAT HUMAN -- IMAGINE
THE SITUATIONS THAT HUMAN BEINGS
ARE IN NOW BECAUSE IT IS
COMPLETELY UNIMAGINABLE.

WE ARE LIVING WITH THE E
MECHANICS OF CARBON THAT WAS
RELEASED 20 YEARS AGO.

WE HAVE 20 MORE YEARS OF REALLY
BAD THINGS HAPPENING AND OUR
SHARE SHOULD BE ON FIRE.

MY SOURCES HERE IS THE "NEW YORK
TIMES."

THE LEVEL OF SUMMER SEA ICE IS
THE LOWEST THAT'S EVER BEEN
RECORDED.

THE ARCTIC AT SOME POINT IN THE
LAST WINTER WAS WARMER THAN
SPAIN BECAUSE THE JET STREAM IS
SLOWING AS THE ARCTIC MELTS.
AND PARTS OF THE JET STREAMS IT
SPLIT.

THE JET STREAM SPLIT MOVING COLD
AIR DOWN TO SPAIN AND ONE AIR UP
INTO THE ARCTIC AND AS CAM
MENTIONED, THE GULFSTREAM HAS
FLOWED.

IT'S ESTIMATED BY ONE RESEARCHER
TO HAVE FLOWED 15%.

THIS IS A MAJOR DRIVER OF THE

CLIMATE THAT WE ARE USED TO GROW
OUR FOOD.

SO I JUST WANT TO SAY THAT I
REALLY APPRECIATE THE WORK THAT
WE ALL NEED TO ACT LIKE OUR HAIR
IS ON FIRE JUST THE WAY WE
WISHED PEOPLE HAD ACTED BEFORE
9/11.

PEOPLE SAID WE KNEW SOMETHING
WAS HAPPENING OUR HAIR WAS ON
FIRE.

OUR HAIR IS ON FIRE.

THANK YOU SO MUCH.

>> THANK YOU.

[APPLAUSE]

>> AN, JAMES AND MONICA.

>> HELLO.

MY NAME IS ALAN.

I'M HERE IN MY ROLL AS DIRECTOR
OF ORGANIZING FOR 3550 MASS.
WE'RE A STATEWIDE NETWORK OF
VOLUNTEERS FIGHTING CLIMATE
CHANGE AND THAT INCLUDES DOZEN
OF ACTIVE RESIDENTS OF BOSTON.
AND THERE ARE THINGS I WANT TO
TALK ABOUT BRIEFLY ARE URGENCY
AND LEADERSHIP.

CITIES AROUND THE COMMONWEALTH
WILL TAKE THEIR CUES AND
DIRECTION FROM THE LEADERSHIP OF
BOSTON AND THAT IS TRUE FOR
CITIES AROUND THE UNITED STATES
AND AROUND THE WORLD AS WELL AND
HAS BEEN MADE CLEAR EARLIER.
WE'RE NOT ON TRACK TO MEET THE
GOALS OF PARIS AND IT IS REALLY
UP TO CITIES THAT HAVE THE
POTENTIAL TO TAKE ACTION ON
CLIMATE CHANGE TO DO SO.

THE DELAY IS ATTACK PARTICULAR
THAT HAS BEEN IMEMPLOYED BY THE
FOSSIL FUEL INDUSTRY FOR DECADES
AND DELAY WILL COST US MILLIONS
OF LIVES.

AND THAT'S THE REALITY.

THE REDENTS OF BOSTON WANTS
COMMUNITY CHOICE ENERGY.

THE PEOPLE OF THE WORLD
DESPERATELY NEED THE LEADERSHIP
OF BOSTON TO DO ALL THAT WE CAN.
AND WHO IS DELAYING BENEFITS.
IT BENEFITS INVESTORRED OWNED
UTILITIES.

WE WANT TO CHALLENGE THE BOSTON

ADMINISTRATION TO PROVE TO US
THAT THE WILL OF THE RESIDENTS
MEANS MORE THAN THE PROFITS OF
THE INDUSTRIAL UTILITIES.

IF YOU'RE SERIOUS GOING CARBON
FORTY THREE.

CARBON -- FREE, IF YOU WANT
TO -- THE REST ON OF THE WORLD
WE NEED TO IMPLEMENT CCE NOW.

>> THANK YOU.

[APPLAUSE]

JOHN AND MONICA AND THEN THE
LAST PERSON THAT I HAVE IS MICA
WHO I BELIEVE LEFT WITH HIS DAD.
SO JOHN AND MONICA AND THEN IS
THERE ANYONE ELSE WHO WISHES TO
TESTIFY THAT EITHER DIDN'T SIGN.
PLEASE OF COURSE YOU JUST WANT
TO LINE UP.

AND THEN ANYBODY ELSE.

JUST COME ON-LINE.

I APOLOGIZE IF I MISSED YOUR
NAME OR IF YOU DIDN'T SIGN IN.
PLEASE.

JOHN.

>> THANK YOU.

COUNCILOR O'MALLEY AND THE
ENVIRONMENTAL COMMITTEE.

I THINK PRETTY MUCH EVERYONE
HERE HAS COVERED ALL THE
IMPORTANT POINTS.

THE URGENCY THAT THE FOLKS IN
THIS ROOM FEEL ABOUT THE ISSUE
OF CLIMATE CHANGE AND THE
FRUSTRATION DISAPPOINTMENT AND
I'M CARRYING RIGHT NOW THE
SORROW OF THE MISSED
OPPORTUNITIES, THE LACK OF
LEADERSHIP WHEN IT'S DESPERATELY
NEEDED, IT'S URGENT AND YET IT'S
NOT HAPPENING.

AND HOW DO WE GET AS

[INDISCERNIBLE] SAID HOW DO WE
GET PEOPLE TO HAVE THEIR HAIR ON
FIRE.

WHAT DO WE DO TO GET PEOPLE TO
WAKE UP.

WE HAVE A SYSTEM NOW WHERE THE
FASHIONAL FUEL INDUSTRY, WHICH
CERTAINLY INCLUDES THE FRACK GAS
STROY WHICH CERTAINLY INCLUDES
THE INVESTOR OWNED UTILITIES IS
TELLING US THAT GAS IS A BRIDGE
FUEL THAT IT'S ALMOST RENEWABLE

YOU'VE SEEN THE ADS ON TV.
IT'S CHEAP, IT'S WONDERFUL.
A COUPLE WEEKS AGO, A GROUP OF
ENVIRONMENTAL ACTIVISTS BROUGHT
TO JAMAICA PLAIN AND TO LOWELL
AND TO THE STATE HOUSE AND TO
THE SITE OF THE BACK BAY
MILLIONAIRE'S PIPELINE, A GROUP
OF ACTIVISTS FROM PENNSYLVANIA
WHO ARE IN THE ZONES OF THE
FRACKING FIELDS WHO TOLD US
STORIES OF INCREDIBILITY
STRUCTION AND DAMAGE TO THEIR
COMMUNITIES, TO THEIR PERSONAL
HEALTH.

WE HAD A LITTLE TEN YEAR OLD
CUTE LITTLE BOY PULLING HAIR OUT
OF HIS HEAD SHOWING US, YOU
KNOW, THE LOSS, HIS FATHER
SHOWING US THE LOSS OF HAIR.
HE'S PRELEUKEMIA, HE'S NOT
NEUROLOGIC DISEASES.

THIS STUFF IS NOT CLEAN, IT'S
DIRTY, IT'S AWFUL.

WE NEED TO GET OFF IT.

THAT'S ESTABLISHED.

THE POSITION OF THE WALSH
ADMINISTRATION IS THAT FRACK GAS
IS THE BRIDGE FUEL AND WE'RE
PROCEED IN THAT FASHION AS IF IT
IS.

HOW DO WE CONVINCED THEM
OTHERWISE?

I'M THINKING NOW, I'VE BEEN
THINKING ACTUALLY FOR SOMETIME
ABOUT A FELLOW NAMED DAVID
BECKAL.

HE WAS AN ACTIVIST AND LAWYER
WHO WON SEVERAL IMPORTANT CASES
ON BEHALF OF THE LGBT Q
COMMUNITIES AND THEIR RIGHTS.

AT THE TIME OF HIS RECENT DEATH
CAN HE WAS KNOWN AS THE
COMPOSING KING OF BROOKLYN.

MR. BECKAL SELF IMMUNOLATED
LAST MONTH IN PROCESS PECK PARK
BROOKLYN.

HIS SUICIDE NOTE INCLUDED SOME
OF THE FOLLOWING.

MOST HUMANS ON THE PLANET NOW
BREATHE AIR MADE ON HEALTHY
FOSSIL FUELS AND MANY DIE EARLY
DEATH AS A RESULT.

THE DEATH OF FOSSIL FUMES IS

WHAT WE'RE DOING TO OURSELVES.
HE ADDED I -- LAWN RULE PURPOSE
AND DEATH.

MY QUESTION REMAINS, WHAT DO WE
DO TO CONVINCING THE WALSH
ADMINISTRATION AND OUR FELLOW
CITIZENS THAT WE HAVE TO MOVE
QUICKLY AWAY FROM FOSSIL FUELS.
>> THANK YOU.

[APPLAUSE]

MONICA.

>> GOOD AFTERNOON.

PIE NAME IS MONICA BRIGGS AND I
LIVE IN JAMAICA PLAINS.
I'M A MEMBER OF BOSTON COMMON
NETWORK.

AND I'M PRESENTING A VERY
PERSONAL PART OF THIS WHOLE
ISSUE.

I AM LOW INCOME BUT I STILL WANT
TO BE PART OF THE CLIMATE
SOLUTION.

SOMETIMES THAT'S A LITTLE TRICKY
BUT THERE ARE A LOT OF DOOR
DOORKNOCKERS WHO COME WITH VERY
TEMPTING CLIP BOARDS AND
SOLUTIONS TO YOUR GREEN ENERGY
WISHES.

I'VE BEEN LURED INTO TWO OF THE
CONTRACTS AND HAD TO COMBAT THE
FINE PRINT AND GET OUT OF PAYING
A MUCH LARGER AMOUNT OF MONEY
FOR MY ELECTRICITY THAN I HAD
PLANNED.

THESE ARE ALL OVER THE CITY TO
THE VULNERABLE LOW INCOME.

SO CCE FOR ME IS REALLY A UNIQUE
OPPORTUNITY FOR SOMETHING THAT'S
VETTED, SOMETHING THAT'S CITY
WIDE, SOMETHING THAT HAS BEEN
PROVEN 140 TIMES OVER BY THE
STATE OF MASSACHUSETTS TO BE
EFFECTIVE.

AND IT'S ALSO AN OPPORTUNITY FOR
SOMEBODY LIKE MYSELF TO BE PART
OF A VERY AMBITIOUS AND VERY
VITAL EFFORT TO COMBAT CLIMATE
CHANGE.

AND THERE AREN'T A WHOLE LOT OF
OPPORTUNITIES TO DO THAT FOR
PEOPLE WHO ARE LOW INCOME, WHO
MAY NOT HAVE THE EDUCATION TO
UNDERSTAND THOSE BEING INVOLVED.
AND THIS IS ALSO A WAY OF

SPREADING INFORMATION AND HOPE
ABOUT HOW TO BE PART OF
SOMETHING THAT IS HOPEFUL AND
THOUGHT CAN ACTUALLY HELP THE
PLANET THAN SOMETIMES FALLING
OVERWHELMING THREE NOT MUCH OUT
THERE.

SO IT EDGE CASE PEOPLE ABOUT
WAYS TO CHANGE THE WORLD THAT
MIGHT NOT HAVE AXIS TO THAT.
SO I REALLY ENCOURAGE CCE TO
DEAL WITH THAT REAL THEY AND TO
GIVE EVERYONE AN OPPORTUNITY.
THANK YOU.

>> THANK YOU VERY MUCH.
PLAZA ANY INDIVIDUALS I DIDN'T
CALL WHO WOULD LIKE TO TESTIFY
JUST SAY YOUR NAME AND
AFFILIATION FOR THE RECORD.
AGAIN WE'LL TRY TO KEEP IT TO
TWO MINUTES, THANK YOU.