



City of Boston, Massachusetts  
Office of Police Accountability and Transparency

## **Civilian Review Board (CRB) Public Meeting**

### **Minutes**

**Tuesday, May 21, 2024 | Scheduled for 10:00 a.m.**

**In-Person Meeting | 2201 Washington St, Suite 102, Roxbury, MA 02119**

**Call to order at 10:04 a.m.**

**Civilian Review Board (CRB) Members Present:** Chair E. Peter Alvarez; Natalie Carithers Utley; Tara Register; Anne Hernandez; B. Chris Sumner; Joshua Dankoff; Rev. Wayne S. Daley.

### **Introduction**

Chair E. Peter Alvarez opened the meeting by welcoming members of the public and the CRB members present. Chair Alvarez reminded the public that public comment would not be heard during this meeting and that any comments could be sent to [opatboards@boston.gov](mailto:opatboards@boston.gov). Chair Alvarez conducted a roll call for members and stated there was quorum.

### **Review and Approval of Previous Meeting Minutes**

The April 25, 2024 minutes were approved as presented by a vote of 5-0 by the CRB with one member of the board abstaining from the vote. No corrections were made.

### **OPAT Executive Director's Report**

Chair Alvarez introduced the new OPAT Executive Director, Evandro C. Carvahlo, to provide the Director's Report.

Executive Director Carvahlo reported on some of OPAT's latest activity as well as introducing himself to the public. Director Carvahlo introduced another new member of the OPAT staff, Eric James. Director Carvahlo also reported on some of the professional development that OPAT staff have been completing over the past several months.



City of Boston, Massachusetts  
Office of Police Accountability and Transparency

Board members asked for some details from OPAT Staff regarding the staff's professional development. Board member Dankoff also asked when the City would appoint new members to the OPAT boards.

**Other Business**

Chair Alvarez proceeded to move on to other business for the CRB. No other business was presented.

**Complaint Summary & Disposition**

After a review and investigation and in accordance with 12-16.7 (b) of the Ordinance, OPAT Staff referred the following cases to the Civilian Review Board for review and recommendation of disposition: Case #98, Case #196, Case #229, Case #238, Case #240, Case #241, Case #256, and Case #278. OPAT Staff also dismissed the following cases due to insufficient evidence and no misconduct alleged: Case #214, Case #228, Case #265 and Case #289.

Chair Alvarez stated that the CRB would enter an executive session, pursuant to Open Meeting Law, M.G.L. c.30A, § 21(a)(1) and § 21(a)(7), combined with M.G.L. c. 30A, §§ 22(f) and (g), to hear the remaining cases in order to discuss the complaints brought against a Boston Police Department public officer, employee, staff member, or individual. Chair Alvarez stated that the CRB would reconvene in a public session to hold a roll call vote on the disposition of the cases remaining on the docket.

Board Member Joshua Dankoff motioned to enter into Executive Session and received a second from Board Member Tara Register. The motion was unanimously agreed upon by the Board.

The CRB's executive session was called to order at 10:19 a.m. and adjourned at 2:25 p.m.

**Complaint Summary & Disposition – Public Session**

Chair Alvarez reconvened the CRB meeting in its public session at 3:25 p.m.

Chair Alvarez held roll call votes on each of the cases presented to the CRB during its executive session.



City of Boston, Massachusetts  
Office of Police Accountability and Transparency

In the matter of **Case #98**, the Civilian Review Board agreed unanimously (6-0) with OPAT Staff's recommended **Sustained** disposition, with one board member abstaining due to them not being present during the discussion of the case. The Civilian Review Board voted unanimously (6-0), with one board member abstaining, to adopt a disciplinary action of a **One (1) Day Suspension**. The Civilian Review Board also recommended that the Boston Police Department rule committee create a policy specifically for the use of sirens on non-emergency vehicles.

In the matter of **Case #96**, the Civilian Review Board voted unanimously (6-0) to agree with OPAT's recommended disposition of **Not Sustained**, with one board member abstaining from voting due to not being present during the discussion of the case.

In the matter of **Case #229**, the Civilian Review Board voted unanimously (6-0) to agree with OPAT's recommended disposition of **Not Sustained**, with one board member abstaining from voting due to not being present during the discussion of the case.

In the matter of **Case #18**, with regard to **Officers ID #099212, ID #126483, ID #108893, ID #081698, ID #106678, ID #011613**, and the alleged violations of BPD Rule 102 § 4, Rule 304 § 2, Rule 306A § 2, and Rule 315 § 12D the CRB voted (6-0) to adopt the recommended disposition of **Not Sustained and Insufficient Evidence to Make a Finding**.

In the matter of **Case #127**, the CRB voted unanimously (6-0) to adopt OPAT Staff's recommended disposition of **Sustained** with regard to Officers Melvin Ruiz and Kirk Maxwell's alleged violations of Fourth Amendment Rights and BPD Rule 102 § 4. Accompanying recommended discipline from the Board is a **Four Day Suspension** for the officers involved.



City of Boston, Massachusetts  
Office of Police Accountability and Transparency

**Meeting Adjourned at 3:39 p.m.**

DRAFT