



City of Boston, Massachusetts  
Office of Police Accountability and Transparency

## **Civilian Review Board (CRB) Public Meeting**

### **Minutes**

**Thursday, April 25, 2024 | Scheduled for 1:00 p.m.**

**In-Person Meeting | 2201 Washington St, Suite 102, Roxbury, MA 02119**

**Call to order at 1:10 p.m.**

**Civilian Review Board (CRB) Members Present:** Chair E. Peter Alvarez; Natalie Carithers Utley; Tara Register; Anne Hernandez; B. Chris Sumner; Rev. Wayne S. Daley.

**Civilian Review Board (CRB) Members Absent:** Joshua Dankoff.

### **Introduction**

Chair E. Peter Alvarez opened the meeting by welcoming members of the public and the CRB members present. Chair Alvarez reminded the public that public comment would not be heard during this meeting and that any comments could be sent to [opatboards@boston.gov](mailto:opatboards@boston.gov). Chair Alvarez conducted a roll call for members and stated there was quorum.

### **Review and Approval of Previous Meeting Minutes**

The January 23, 2024 minutes were approved as presented by a unanimous vote of the CRB. No corrections were made.

### **Other Business**

Chair Alvarez proceeded to move on to other business for the CRB. Chair Alvarez acknowledged the audience members and thanked them for their attendance. No other business was presented.

### **Complaint Summary & Disposition**

After a review and investigation and in accordance with 12-16.7 (b) of the Ordinance, OPAT Staff referred the following cases to the Civilian Review Board for review and recommendation of disposition: Case #18, Case #98, Case #127, Case #197, Case #214, Case #228, Case #229, Case #238, Case #240, Case #241, Case #255, and Case #278.



City of Boston, Massachusetts  
Office of Police Accountability and Transparency

Chair Alvarez stated that the CRB would enter an executive session, pursuant to Open Meeting Law, M.G.L. c.30A, § 21(a)(1) and § 21(a)(7), combined with M.G.L. c. 30A, §§ 22(f) and (g), to hear the remaining cases in order to discuss the complaints brought against a Boston Police Department public officer, employee, staff member, or individual. Chair Alvarez stated that the CRB would reconvene in a public session to hold a roll call vote on the disposition of the cases remaining on the docket.

Board Member Anne Hernandez motioned to enter into Executive Session and received a second from Board Member Natalie Carithers. The motion was unanimously agreed upon by the Board.

The CRB's executive session was called to order at 1:20 p.m. and adjourned at 3:25 p.m.

**Complaint Summary & Disposition – Public Session**

Chair Alvarez reconvened the CRB meeting in its public session at 3:25 p.m.

Chair Alvarez held roll call votes on each of the cases presented to the CRB during its executive session.

In the matter of **Case #18**, due to the large group of named BPD Officers in the complaint the CRB used ID numbers to identify officers with separate recommended dispositions for the alleged rule violations.

In the matter of **Case #18**, with regard to **Officer ID #102955** and the violations of BPD Rule 102 § 4, Rule 304 § 2, and Rule 318A § 4 the CRB voted (6-0) to adopt the disposition of **Sustained**. For **Officer ID #102955**, with regard to the allegation of the violations of BPD Rule 306A § 2 and Rule 318 § 2 the CRB voted unanimously (6-0) to adopt a disposition of **Not Sustained**. The recommended discipline by OPAT staff for **Officer ID #102955** is **Termination**. The CRB voted Five to One (**5-1**) to agree with the recommended disposition of **Termination**. CRB member Rev. Wayne Daley voted to disagree with the disposition of Termination and suggested **Suspension/Training**.



City of Boston, Massachusetts  
Office of Police Accountability and Transparency

In the matter of **Case #18**, with regard to **Officer ID #140306** and the violations of BPD Rule 102 § 3, Rule 102 § 9, the CRB voted (6-0) to adopt the disposition of **Sustained**. For **Officer ID #140306**, with regard to the allegation of the violations of BPD Rule 306A and Rule 306A § 2 the CRB voted unanimously (6-0) to adopt a disposition of **Not Sustained**. The recommended discipline by OPAT staff for **Officer ID #140306** is a **5 Day Suspension**. The CRB voted unanimously (6-0) to change the recommended discipline to a **4 Day Suspension with Training**.

In the matter of **Case #18**, with regard to **Officers ID #099212, ID #126483, ID #108893, ID #081698, ID #106678, ID #011613**, and the alleged violations of BPD Rule 102 § 4, Rule 304 § 2, Rule 306A § 2, and Rule 315 § 12D the CRB voted (6-0) to adopt the recommended disposition of **Not Sustained and Insufficient Evidence to Make a Finding**.

In the matter of **Case #127**, the CRB voted unanimously (6-0) to adopt OPAT Staff's recommended disposition of **Sustained** with regard to alleged violations of Fourth Amendment Rights and BPD Rule 102 § 4. With regard to the alleged violation of BPD Rule 102 § 9, Rule 102 § 20, and Rule 304 § 2. Accompanying recommended discipline from the Board is a **Four Day Suspension** for the officers involved.

**Meeting Adjourned at 3:39 p.m.**