



City of Boston, Massachusetts  
Office of Police Accountability and Transparency

## **Civilian Review Board (CRB) Public Meeting**

### **Minutes**

**Wednesday, November 20, 2024 | Scheduled for 10:00 a.m.**

**In-Person Meeting | 2201 Washington St, Suite 102, Roxbury, MA 02119**

**Call to order at 10:16 a.m.**

**Civilian Review Board (CRB) Members Present:** Chair E. Peter Alvarez; Natalie Carithers Utley; Anne Hernandez; B. Chris Sumner; Joshua Dankoff; Rev. Wayne S. Daley.

### **Introduction**

Chair E. Peter Alvarez opened the meeting by welcoming members of the public and the CRB members present. Chair Alvarez reminded the public that public comment would not be heard during this meeting and that any comments could be sent to [opatboards@boston.gov](mailto:opatboards@boston.gov). Chair Alvarez conducted a roll call for members and stated there was a quorum.

### **Review and Approval of Previous Meeting Minutes**

The May 21, 2024 minutes were approved as presented by a vote of 6-0 by the CRB. No corrections were made.

### **OPAT Executive Director's Report**

Chair Alvarez introduced the OPAT Executive Director, Evandro C. Carvalho, to provide the Director's Report.

Executive Director Carvalho introduced himself and thanked the board members and OPAT staff for coming to the last board Civilian Review Board meeting of 2024. Director Carvalho introduced two new members of the OPAT staff, Marwa Khudaynazar the new chief of staff, and Michael Berger the new Policy and Data Analyst. He thanked the previous OPAT staff who have since left the team. Director Carvalho talked about the NACOLE (National Association of Civilian Oversight of Law Enforcement) Conference that he recently attended and how beneficial the information he learned will be to the OPAT team. Finally,



City of Boston, Massachusetts  
Office of Police Accountability and Transparency

Director Carvalho acknowledged that there were members of the Media in the meeting from Fox 25 News due to interruption of service of OPAT's website dashboards. He explained that the matter would be resolved immediately. Director Carvalho stated that there will be new board appointments in the upcoming year .

Board members asked for some details from OPAT Staff regarding the staff's professional development. Board Chair Alvarez asked Director Carvalho to share more details about what he learned at NACOLE's conference. Board Member Sumner also asked if OPAT would be issuing apologies to the victims for OPAT's lack of leadership causing cases to be delayed.

**Other Business**

Chair Alvarez proceeded to move on to other business for the CRB. Chair member Joshua Dankoff presented that OPAT opens a sub-committee with 3 people for policy review. The board agreed to put the sub-committee matter on the agenda at the next board meeting to have a more in-depth conversation with the new members.

**Complaint Summary & Disposition**

After a review and investigation and in accordance with 12-16.7 (b) of the Ordinance, OPAT Staff referred the following cases to the Civilian Review Board for review and recommendation of disposition: Case #264, Case #255, Case #274, Case #227, Case #209, Case #222, and Case #276. OPAT Staff also dismissed the following cases due to insufficient evidence and no misconduct alleged: Case #324, Case #325 and Case#230,

Chair Alvarez stated that the CRB would enter an executive session, pursuant to Open Meeting Law, M.G.L. c.30A, § 21(a)(1) and § 21(a)(7), combined with M.G.L. c. 30A, §§ 22(f) and (g), to hear the remaining cases in order to discuss the complaints brought against a Boston Police Department public officer, employee, staff member, or individual. Chair Alvarez stated that the CRB would reconvene in a public session to hold a roll call vote on the disposition of the cases remaining on the docket.

Board Member Joshua Dankoff motioned to enter into Executive Session and received a second from Board Member Anne Hernandez. The motion was unanimously agreed upon by the Board.



City of Boston, Massachusetts  
Office of Police Accountability and Transparency

The CRB's executive session was called to order at 10:56 a.m. and adjourned at 1:55 p.m.

**Complaint Summary & Disposition – Public Session**

Chair Alvarez reconvened the CRB meeting in its public session at 1:55 p.m.

Chair Alvarez held roll call votes on each of the cases presented to the CRB during its executive session.

In the matter of OPAT Case #264, with regards to Sergeant Boyle and the violations of BPD Rule 102 §3 Conduct Unbecoming, Rule 102 § 9 Respectful Treatment, Rule 113§2 Respect and Dignity, the Civilian Review Board reached a unanimous decision (6-0) to sustain. In regards to Rules Rule 102 § 4 Neglect of Duty, 113 § 3 Honesty and Integrity, the board was unable to reach a consensus among its members therefore no findings were made. Based on the Discipline Matrix established by the Boston Police Department, the Civilian Review Board has unanimously recommended that Sergeant Boyle receive a 5-30 day suspension.

In the matter of OPAT Case #255, with regard to Officer Avila and the violations of BPD Rule 102 § 3 Conduct, Rule 102 § 18 Personal Business, Rule 113 § 8 Public Integrity Policy, the Civilian Review Board reached a unanimous decision (6-0) to sustain. With regard to the allegation of the violations of BPD Rule, 114 § 2 Scope the Civilian Review Board voted unanimously (6-0) to adopt a disposition of Not Sustained Based on the Discipline Matrix established by the Boston Police Department. The Civilian Review Board unanimously recommended that Officer Avila be issued a 2-5 day suspension.

In the matter of OPAT Case #274, with regard to Boston Police Operator 282 and the violations of BPD Rule 102 § 3 Conduct, BPD Rule 102 § 9 Respectful Treatment, and BPD Rule 113 Canon Two, the CRB voted (6-0) to adopt the disposition of Exonerated.

In the matter of OPAT Case #227 with regard to Officer Nolen and the violations of BPD Rule 102 § 4 Neglect of Duty, the CRB voted (6-0) to adopt the disposition of Insufficient Evidence to Make a Finding.



City of Boston, Massachusetts  
Office of Police Accountability and Transparency

In the matter of OPAT Case #230, with regard to an Unknown BPD employee and the violations of BPD Rule 102 § 3 Conduct, Rule 102 § Sec. 4 Neglect of Duty, Rule 113 - Public Integrity Policy: Canon One, Rule 113 - Public Integrity Policy: Canon Four, and Rule 302 § 3.3. Emergency Driving, the Civilian Review Board reached a unanimous decision (6-0) to Insufficient Evidence to make a finding. The Board unanimously recommended that all BPD officers receive training on emergency driving and the proper use of BPD equipment.

In the matter of OPAT Case #222, with regard to the two named BPD officers concerning violations of BPD Rule 102 § Sec. 4 Neglect of Duty, the Civilian Review Board reached a unanimous decision (6-0) to Not Sustain.

In the matter of OPAT Case #276, with regard to the two named BPD officers concerning violations of BPD Rule 102 § Sec. 4 Neglect of Duty and 102§9 Respectful Treatment the Civilian Review Board reached a unanimous decision (6-0) to Not Sustain.

In the matter of OPAT Case #209, with regard to the two named BPD officers concerning violations of BPD Rule 102 § Sec. 4 Neglect of Duty, the CRB reached a unanimous decision (6-0) to request an Information Inquiry and will be referred back to OPAT Investigators for further investigation. This matter remains open.

**Meeting Adjourned at 2:11 p.m.**



City of Boston, Massachusetts  
Office of Police Accountability and Transparency

DRAFT