

Boston Employment Commission Hearing Minutes

A monthly hearing of the Boston Employment Commission (**BEC**) was held on Wednesday, January 15, 2020 at One City Hall Plaza, Conference Room 801, Boston, MA 02201.

Commissioners

Present: Commissioner Travis Watson, Commissioner Charles Cofield, Commissioner Stephanie Everett and Commissioner Jorge Martinez

Hearing Begins: 1:01 PM

Commissioner Watson took time to acknowledge the passing of former Boston City Councilor, Chuck Turner and expressed that the BEC/BRJP would not exist without Chuck Turner's advocacy. Commissioner Watson read excerpts from the Obituary and concluded with these words, "I'm thankful for this extraordinary human being".

I. MINUTES

November 20, 2019 minutes were accepted and approved.

II. CONSTRUCTION TRADE PIPELINE PRESENTATIONS

A. Greater Boston Plumbing Contractors Association

Duration: 6 mins.

Presenter: Andrew DeAngelo (Director of Public Affairs)

Andrew DeAngelo (GBPCA): I've been in this position with GBPCA for 6 months. There are 50 Plumbing Contractors signatory to Local #12. Greater Boston PCA is still striving tirelessly to improve the plumbing contracting industry and our member's businesses. This is a work in progress. In July 2015, the Association changed its name to become the Greater Boston PCA in order to better represent its new affiliation with the Mechanical Contractors Association of America, and the continued goals of advancing the plumbing contracting industry in Boston. **Commissioner Watson:** I'm excited about your appointment to GBPCA. What can we as the Commission and as staff of the Mayor's Office of Economic Development (OED) be doing better to help you? **Andrew:** I realize not every contractor has a stellar reputation on diversity. If I can supplement in any way, I'm willing to partner. We are partnering with Building Pathways and Madison Park. On 1/6/20 the apprenticeship program gave out 400 applications. The Aptitude test/class will be held on 1/18/20. There's Spring Interview prep. The Local #12 Apprenticeship Program is a five-year program that combines over 200 hours of in-class learning with hands-on experience to prepare for earning the Journeyman Plumbers and Gasfitters License. Classes provide training in welding, medical gas, solar hot water heating, and rainwater reuse, which applies to a multitude of environments, such as laboratories, and commercial institutions as well as residential areas. **Commissioner Watson:** I've found the construction industry only tells a certain story. To have information prior to our BEC Hearings would help the meeting be more productive.

B. YouthBuild Boston

Duration 10 mins.

Presenter: Alison Marlow (Director of Programs & Operations)

Alison Marlow: I'm representing on behalf of Ken Smith, Executive Director. I've been with YBB for 5 years. YBB will be celebrating our 30 year anniversary this year. Our mission is training residents of Boston ages 14-24. Our pre-apprenticeship program is 90% students of color. We have cross sector partnerships. We have a diverse board. We have a Pre-Apprentice Exploration program (6-9 months Academic and Building

Trades) for non-diploma young people ages 17-24 who have social challenges. Our Accelerated Program is 2 tracks. **Track 1:** 16 week Pre-Apprentice program for young people ages 17-24 with High School Diploma or Equivalent interested in starting a career in building trades will gain real site construction experience. **Track 2:** The Designery program (7 to 10 week sessions) geared toward high school students who want an enriching after-school experience. Students are paid a bi-weekly stipend while they hone fundamental graphic, modeling, and design-thinking skills through real design projects for non-profit clients around the city. 67% of our students go on to trades and employment which can take up to 2 years to get in to the union. John Ronan sends proof of this accomplishment. We partner with Starlight Building Service (Mentoring Program). In addition, the students participate in the Shed Project and Community Servings project with Urban Farming. **Commissioner Watson:** Awesome presentation! If you could provide a list of contractors YBB is working with, we'd like to receive that. **Alison:** We will get that to you as soon as possible. **Commissioner Watson** made reference to YBB partnering with Madison Park some years ago in which 15 MP students worked on affordable housing next to Ideals on Dudley Street. **Alison** expressed that YBB has a new model of one week at YBB site and one week at school. She challenged folks in attendance at the BEC Hearing to adopt our students which would be an impactful way to help. **Commissioner Watson:** What can we do to help? **Alison:** It would be helpful to have a list of those that have an interest in helping with internships or to test their skills. **Commissioner Cofield** referenced Youth Build USA. **Alison** expressed that YBB has no connection with Youth Build USA, but YBB does have partnership with Benjamin Franklin. **Commissioner Cofield:** Let them know they need to come up to speed. They're not helping what YBB has built. I recommend you reach out to Bill Moran and Associates along with union representatives who are in the room today. **Alison:** I will give my business card. **Commissioner Martinez:** Jeff Cook, Headmaster of Urban Science. **Alison:** It is not through the schools. It was done individually. There's hope we can have this conversation with new BPS Superintendent. **Commissioner Martinez:** How can we assist in having the conversations with appropriate people? **Alison:** Gear up for 2020 political campaign to get on line item in 2021. **Commissioner Watson:** You're doing some great work.

III. SPECIAL PRESENTATION

C. 20 West 5th Street

Duration 32 mins.

Present: Thomas Boderick (Trinity Green), Tim Russell (Trinity Green), Dwayne Watts (Conrad Associates), Katrina Conrad (Conrad Associates), Takara Hamilton (BRJP/BPDA Monitor)

Project Overview

Takara Hamilton (BRJP/BPDA Monitor): provided a handout of the project to the Commissioners. **Thomas Broderick (Trinity Green)** expressed that the project has been a learning process. **Commissioner Watson:** I appreciate that you acknowledge you didn't know what you didn't know. **Commissioner Cofield:** Did you do the job on Hamilton Street? I received unfortunate feedback on that project. **Thomas Broderick (Trinity Green):** Yes, I've been to the Carpenters union 7 times. **Katrina Conrad (Conrad Associates):** We will make sure to avoid any mishaps that were experienced with previous project. **Commissioner Watson:** What is estimated completion time? **Thomas Broderick:** Estimated completion is 12/2020. **Katrina:** Through BPDA we are trying to identify eligible Boston residents and women and qualified contractors. **Commissioner Watson:** Any concerns? **Katrina:** J&R Carpentry added 2 Boston residents to their team as they become more familiar, they will add more. **Commissioner Watson:** There's a concern with smaller contractors meeting timely payroll submission. I'm flagging this concern now so there's no problem going forward. Communication is important. **Katrina:** Takara has been extremely helpful. **Takara (BRJP/BPDA Monitor):** When it comes to all the required BRJP forms, Katrina has been on top of it. I'd like to assure, we have it under control. **Commissioner Everett:** The goal of the BEC is not to be adverse. If there is an issue when you get to a certain point so that it doesn't create a problem, communication is necessary. **Commissioner Cofield:** What stage is the project now? **Tim Russell:** Wood Framing/Concrete (currently on 5th floor). **Commissioner Cofield:** There will be no room to correct numbers on concrete. I'd just like us all to be on the same page. **Commissioner Watson:** Are there any preliminary numbers? **Takara:** From my recollection the numbers are 78% POC, 28% BR and 1% F. The project is 20-30% complete. There are plans to increase the female numbers. **Commissioner Cofield:** Are there affordable units? **Thomas Broderick:** There are 10 affordable units out of 54.

Public

Barry Keady (Plumbers Local 12): Who is the plumber? **Answer:** John Larkin? **Barry:** They historically have bad numbers. The plumbers union is committing to give a one job commitment for Boston Resident/Person of Color and Female. **Katrina:** I will talk to you at the end of this meeting. **Commissioner Watson:** Celina, I would like to bring this project back sooner than later. It doesn't have to be at a BEC Hearing. Who are plumbers on site and what is the workforce projection? It's not often we have this kind of commitment. **Thomas Broderick:** This is new to me. Can offer be submitted in writing? **Commissioner Watson:** My gut reaction is to take Barry's offer. **Barry:** I'd be happy to put it in writing. **Commissioner Watson:** When Salesforce is rolled out, will we have access to contractor history? **Takara:** 112 Shawmut is on Salesforce and there's a way to look at that. **Commissioner Watson:** Typically when contractors try to meet goal, someone gets laid off. In the meantime, I'd like data and stats on this project before the next meeting. **Takara:** I will send to Celina.

IV. PROJECT REVIEWS

A. Boston Children's Hospital

Duration: 35 mins.

Present: Ann McDonough (Childrens/Harvard), Brooke Woodson (Suffolk Construction), Margarita Polanco (Suffolk Construction), Jason Lansberry (Suffolk Construction), Paula Guity (Liberty) and Vargas DaSilveira (BRJP Monitor)

Project Overview:

286,149 wkhrs, 25%BR, 29%POC, 5%F

Commissioner Watson asked if this project was previously presented at the BEC and had concerns with Liberty. The answer was yes. Commissioner Watson further stated that if this was a 1st review these current numbers would be seen as a vast improvement. **Brooke Woodson (Suffolk Construction):** The last time the numbers were 17%BR/28%POC/8%F and the current numbers are 23%BR/33%POC/7%F. Brooke acknowledged Paula from Liberty was present. **Commissioner Watson** asked the BRJP staff to look at previous minutes on this project to determine whether it is necessary to bring them back for a meeting. **Commissioner Watson** asked if Daniel Marr does special steel work. The answer was no. **Margarita** expressed that Suffolk has brought the ownership of Daniel Marr in for a meeting and further stated that Daniel Marr is not hiring within their own neighborhood. A Corrective Action was held in June with Daniel Marr on the Field House project. Jeffrey Marr was introduced to Building Pathways and he has been intentional in his efforts to improve. **Vargas DeSalveira (BRJP Monitor):** The last meeting we had was positive. They explained that they have specialized and height is a factor in getting people. There is 20% work remaining. **Commissioner Watson:** I would like to have a conversation with Daniel Marr, sidebar, if not feasible to bring them before the BEC. Commissioner Watson asked the Director of Equity and Inclusion if there was a way that we as a City can put data up so that contractors can see off the top. **Celina Barrios-Millner (Equity and Inclusion):** They will be able to see it on Salesforce and they will be able to see it on our BRJP/BEC website. **Commissioner Watson:** J.F. White? 1200 hours. **Margarita Polanco (Suffolk Construction):** We do address. **Commissioner Cofield:** We have a relationship but we don't always get the calls. If we're not training people to take over, we'll be in major trouble. There's still a lot of room to make things better. No disrespect to your comment, Vargas, our people are not afraid of heights. We're training people to do this (50/50 – scaffolding). **Commissioner Watson:** Payroll Submission? **Margarita:** We've done our best which is why they're down to 12 days. Need to go back and cross check the Boston resident verifications. Workforce request was sent over. There is a relationship with YouthBuild Boston and Building Pathways. Cycle 22 - Local 4 Women placing graduates on other Suffolk projects. High School Road shows (Corey Allen). **Commissioner Cofield:** If you go into some of these high schools in Boston, they feel excluded. **Brooke:** Partnered with BPS – Future of Construction and took them to 3 technology related spaces. Showed there are lots of opportunities in construction. **Commissioner Cofield:** If companies in this room are not developing mentor programs to talk to young people, we're doing a disservice. **Commissioner Watson:** Was America Plumbing the one that placed that young man during last month's BEC? They're doing an outstanding job on this. Please relay that to them. These are the folks we want to hire. At the Commission, we do a good job saying what's wrong and we want to acknowledge what's right. **Margaret:** Barry Keady of Local 12 has worked well with us.

Public

Priscilla Flint-Lowe (Black Economic Justice Institute): We are going to continue the work of Chuck Turner. We need to let people know we are not going to accept the bad faith effort. **Commissioner Watson:** If it makes sense for the Boston Jobs Coalition to share, quarterly, what you're seeing and hearing, that would be helpful. **Herb Lozano (Bill Moran & Assoc.):** My take away is that there's a barrier between programs. Bill Moran and Associates is a mentoring program existing for 3 years now. We have 40 members and a partnership with IBEW Local 103. Because there's a lot of construction in the city, we've successfully enrolled them into the union. It's important to focus on retention of these people who are getting into the union. Key is retention and that's our new focus. We are happy to partner with organizations that are here. **Commissioner Watson:** Please leave your information. Herb A. Lozano, Program Manager, Bill Moran & Associates, 617-708-6560, herblozano33@gmail.com.

B. Winthrop Center

Duration: 37 mins.

Present: Kathleen MacNeil (Millenium Partners), Corey Allen (Suffolk Construction), Brooke Woodson (Suffolk Construction), John Newhall (Suffolk Construction), Sean Forince (Bill Moran & Associates) and Pam Ruffol (BRJP Monitor)

Project Overview:

65,668 wkhrs, 42%BR, 28%POC, 17%F

Commissioner Watson: It felt really good reviewing this report. **Pam Ruffo (BRJP Monitor):** East Slurry has stayed committed. Aztec – solid workforce – stayed committed even though they had a layoff. Visible site – lots of walk-on but only 1 union walk-on applied. Heritage and S&F are scheduled for a corrective action meeting. **Kathleen MacNeil (Millenium Partners):** Millenium Partners (Tim Coury) is committed to BRJP goals with a deliberate/intentional approach. Mentorship is also an intentional focus. Separate from construction, the goal is to employ diverse individuals after it opens. If Salesforce allows access to contractor history that's helpful. Suffolk has access to that. You're not getting this job unless we get your history/price/bid. MP signed a recent project with unions \$50,000 to child care to support that advocacy and we're working closely with various groups. Project Labor agreement - best thing to provide funding. We have the data and we can see the zip codes where the women are coming from. Every worker is being trained with diversity. Respect matters. It means a lot to get a sticker on your hard hat. Diversity practices is a benchmark. **Commissioner Watson:** I get the politics. It's clear that there's a passion with your company to do it right. What's driving that? **Kathy:** It's personal, intentional and I'm a woman. I haven't seen a difference in my career and I want to see that before I check out. \$830,000,000 - at some point break down initiatives that cost money and those that didn't but did cost time. **Commissioner Watson:** Have you connected with Councilor/Congresswoman Ayanna Pressley regarding child care? **Kathy:** It was then Councilor Pressley that challenged us. Since she's moved to congress we haven't met with her but it's a thought. **Commissioner Watson:** Help us understand the development of your direction. **Kathy:** Madison Park and Suffolk Construction have given me opportunity to use my community outreach. Paula has been very helpful in getting the numbers right. It's a collaborative effort. I'd like to also shout out to the unions – huge transparency in unions. Liberty story. Marty Walsh – lay off someone called direct. We have to allow these other folks become the best bud. **Commissioner Watson:** The transition with the union is instrumental from Brian Doherty. Huge sizemic shift. Best Practices - Mass Port (example). Would like you to consider memorializing what you're doing in a case study, Best Practice document. **Kathy:** I will get you copies. I do this for BPDA and would like feedback. **Commissioner Watson:** I appreciate A.A. Will's letter. Any conversation? What's their core crew. East Coast is an affiliate of A.A. Will. **Commissioner Cofield:** Local 56 doesn't have the people. It's hard, nasty work. Not too many want to do that. **Corey Allen (Suffolk Construction):** Took young Building Pathway students out and their eyes were wide open to the hard work it is. **Commissioner Cofield:** Focusing more on Boston residents as oppose to People of Color. Keep up the good work. **Corey:** Charlie (Commissioner Cofield) and I have interviewed students. **Brooke:** Corey and Pam are on top of things. Thank you to Kathy for bringing Corey on this project. **Sean Forince (Bill Moran & Associates):** IBEW 103 is glad to work with us and have committed to be an ambassador with other unions. **Brian Doherty:** Thank you to the Building Trades Unions. Thank you to BRJP staff/Celina and Peter Sasso. Challenging us and working in partnership. 100 years 2% women. Today, Project Labor Union has a new tool to create career pathway (1st in nation). Respectful workplace practice. Care that

Works. Suffolk Partnership. On behalf of trades, thank you to all the stakeholders. Thanks to the Walsh Administration. **Barry Keady (Local 12 Plumbers):** With women in construction, children/childcare is a factor. Pre-fabrication jobs (flexible start times) can be a beneficial alternative. TG Gallagher – trained a single mother on CAD. EM Duggan – has a lot of women. **Commissioner Watson:** That’s worth picking up and digging into it. We need to change how we look at compliance. **Kathy:** I’ve had pre-fab conversation. I challenged our team to pilot it. We have resources to do that and will give you outcome. **Corey:** BPS/next Thursday, Bfit and Canistrarro.

C. Langone & Puopolo Parks

Duration: 31 mins.

Present: Kenneth Vogel (WES Construction), Mike Christian (WES Construction), Cathy Baker-Eclipse (Parks and Recreation) and Claudette Austin (BRJP Monitor).

Project Overview:

6,758 wkhrs, 17%BR, 17%POC, 5%F

Commissioner Watson: Is this file sub? **Claudette Austin (BRJP Monitor):** Not a file sub bid. **Cathy Baker-Eclipse (Parks and Recreation):** It’s flat work. **Commissioner Watson:** Typically we would like GC’s to consider past history. Was this about low bid? **Kenneth Vogel (WES Construction):** We had to beg Haywood Baker and Hub Foundation to do the work for us. **Commissioner Watson:** We would like to know who you tried to get. **Ken:** We will send that information. We have a standard crew of 5 employees. 2 local people of color/resident/female (injured out for month and held her position, but she was unable to work and we had to let her go and hired another female laborer. We have commitment of a person of color resident local 4 starting in the Spring. **Commissioner Watson:** Workforce projections for remaining workers coming on. Mass Bay, Haywood, Hub – Commitment. What is your conversation on how to right this ship (Cathy)? These numbers don’t mesh. **Cathy:** This is one of the largest projects we put out to bid. I understand Ken’s point. I think WES understands Boston’s goal. I’m not involved in their hiring decisions. **Commissioner Watson:** What’s your role as awarding authority? I’m in charge of design. (Means and Methods) I’m not involved in hiring. There’s not a developer/GC contractor as there is in the private sector. **Commissioner Watson:** Is there a potential opportunity for that role to be (construction liaison). **Cathy:** We follow our procurement protocol. I’ve had frank conversations with the contractors. This is my first time seeing the stats on past performance. If there were more consistent reviews on contractor history, it would be helpful. **Commissioner Watson:** Is it easy to find the data on past performance? **Ken Vogel (WES Construction):** I did not know we could get past performance. **Commissioner Everett:** Celina, is it possible for the lowest bidder to go through salesforce? When someone is awarded, do they have to use salesforce? **Commissioner Watson:** One of my request to the City Council was to figure out a way to systematically dismantle the culture of the normalcy. **Celina:** 2 parts – Policy piece – defining responsible ad and qualified bidders. Bring in City depts., Colleagues, Line depts.. to train on salesforce. **Commissioner Martinez:** From City perspective, we can do better. We have to show before we can ask others to do. There should have been a dialogue when you came into this position. All the municipalities that encompass our city and employ a lot of workers. This needs to be a priority. I don’t see us sanctioning for not living up to the numbers. **Commissioner Cofield:** Are you still signatory to the Carpenters union? L&L should bring numbers up when cement is poured. Who’s doing assembly? **Ken:** We haven’t signed anyone to playground yet. **Commissioner Watson:** Come back in 3 – 4 months. **Claudette,** yes. **Commissioner Cofield:** Remaining work – Stadium Lighting? **Mike Christian (WES Construction):** Hub will work on that.

V. DIRECTOR’S REPORT:

Duration: 4 mins.

Celina (Equity and Inclusion Director): There’s a transition in our team exciting and devastating. Claudette Austin is retiring after 30 years of service. This is a huge loss of institutionalism. She has poured a lot in to the BRJP team. Her last day is January 31, 2020. We wish her all the best. Commissioner Wright resigned her position due to relocation. We are looking for recommendations to fill her seat. As we can see, conference room 801 has been renovated and we are looking to leverage the use of these screens for future BEC presentations as we pilot Salesforce beginning next month, February.

Director’s report accepted.

Hearing adjourned at 3:43 pm.