













































































CITY OF BOSTON THE ENVIRONMENT DEPARTMENT

Boston City Hall, Room 709 • Boston, MA 02201 • 617/635-3850 • FAX: 617/635-3435

30 September 2014

Spruce Place Proprietors

24 Chesture Server

24 Chestnut Street
Boston, MA 02108
Attn: Lynda Schubert Bodman

REMEDIAL ACTION ORDER

Re: Spruce Place

Dear Ms. Bodman,

At its 18 September 2014 public hearing, the Beacon Hill Architectural Commission (BHAC) reviewed the violation issued to Spruce Place on 9 September 2014 for a failure to comply with a Certificate of Appropriateness dated 29 July 2014. The Certificate of Appropriateness was issued for the replacement of driveway and sidewalk paving materials along Spruce Place and installation of gas lanterns. While Spruce Place is a private alley, the majority of the alley is clearly visible from Spruce Street, a public way.

The commission understood based on photographs and testimony from abutters that a significant excavation had been undertaken in advance of resurfacing the alley, and that the resurfacing had not restored the grade to its previous condition. While you testified that the project was completed in compliance with the Certificate of Appropriateness granted for the project, photographs submitted by abutters as well a site visit by staff prior to the hearing offered evidence to the contrary. Further, upon viewing photographs of the work, the commission questioned whether the stones installed as decorative banding along the alley were in compliance with their 29 July 2014 approval. The commission was additionally aware of damage to adjacent buildings, which it understands to be the subject of private recourse. The commission deferred a determination on either the materials or the extent of the excavation until such time that a site visit could be made. The commission therefore appointed a subcommittee, consisting of Chairman Joel Pierce and Commissioner Ken Taylor, assisted by the staff, to review the project on site.

Thus on 26 September 2014, at a publicly noticed meeting, the subcommittee met at Spruce Place to review the violation. The commissioners observed that a significant excavation had been completed along the length of the alley, exposing portions of those building elevations and foundations along its southern boundary that were documented to have lain below the former grade conditions. A clearly visible line demarcated conditions that were previously below grade, with the most extreme excavation having been completed at the east end of the alley. At the rear of the carriage house of 45 Beacon Street, approximately 14" of masonry that had previously been below grade was now exposed. The commissioners noted damage as well as unauthorized masonry repairs to abutting buildings, including 45 Beacon Street, 3, 5, 7 and 9 Spruce Place, and 3 Spruce Street. The commission further observed that large granite bollard previously in place at the northeast corner of the carriage house of 45 Beacon Street was now missing.

The commissioners commented that extensive excavation and regrading work, resulting in an exposure of below grade conditions, was neither documented in the project application nor presented at the hearing when the project was reviewed. The commission commented that the stone installed as decorative banding does not resemble cobblestones or any other pavers within the visual vocabulary of the district in dimension, texture, or color. Further, they noted that per project drawings, the cobbles were to abut the buildings on the south side of the alley, whereas as installed there is an approximately 4" gap between the pavers and the adjacent buildings. They nonetheless concluded that despite its lack of precedent, the material itself generally complied with that documented in the project application, noting that a sample had not been submitted for review.

The subcommittee directed that the grade must be restored along those buildings on the south side of the alley (including the carriage house to 45 Beacon Street, 3, 5, 7 and 9 Spruce Place, and 3 Spruce Street). No portion of these buildings that previously sat below grade may remain exposed. The subcommittee understood based on photographic documentation that a berm was formerly used to cover approximately two courses of brick at the rear of the carriage house to 45 Beacon Street

(over)

REMEDIAL ACTION ORDER Spruce Place 30 September 2014 (continued)

as well as portions of the adjacent buildings. A berm not to exceed that previously in place shall accordingly be reintroduced. The subcommittee understood the damage to adjacent buildings to be a result of your project, and therefore directed that appropriate repairs be made, with the consent and agreement of those property owners, such that this damage shall be corrected. The subcommittee anticipated that the new grading for the alley will require the review of the City of Boston's Inspectional Services Department. Before corrective work may proceed, detailed project drawings documenting the grading of the alley must be submitted to the commission for review, as well as documentation of any repairs to adjacent buildings.

To signify your agreement with the terms of this Remedial Action Order, please execute and return the enclosed Compliance Agreement as soon as possible. This violation will remain in effect until resolved to the satisfaction of the commission. Under district legislation, architectural violations are subject to penalty, including fines of up to \$500.00, with each day constituting a separate offense.

Thanking you for your anticipated cooperation,

For the commission,

Em Dolutz Erin Ross Doherty

Preservation Planner
Beacon Hill Architectural Commission

cc: Eben Kunz, Kunz Associates

Sandy Steele

Dave Johnson, Inspectional Services Department

Abutters