

Boston Employment Commission Regular Meeting Minutes

A regular meeting of the Boston Employment Commission was held on February 21, 2018 in Room 801, at City Hall, Boston, MA 02201.

Commissioners Present:

Commissioner Travis Watson, Commissioner Charles Cofield, Commissioner Mark Fortune, Commissioner John Redd, and Commissioner Deborah Wright.

Meeting Begins: 3:03PM.

I. Meeting Minutes

Commissioner Watson asked if there were any comments pertaining to last month’s meeting minutes. A motion was made to accept minutes.

The minutes from the January 17, 2018 meeting were accepted and approved.

II. Special Presentations

A. Residences at Brighton Marine

Duration: 15 mins

Present: LeAnn Hanfield (Winn Development), Dan Moore (Cranshaw Construction), Sandy Paben (Renaissance Groups), and Robert Woodson (BRJP Monitor).

Commissioner Watson disclosed that Cranshaw Construction is an affiliate of National Development who is a board member of Mass Housing Impact Corporation, Commissioner Watson’s employer.

(Correction made on BEC Report to reflect this project is subject to New Ordinance, 51%, 40%, 12%.)

Project Overview:

A Department of Neighborhood and Development project, **under the New BRJP Ordinance**, Brighton Marine Housing Limited Partnership will create 102 units of new mixed-income rental housing with a preference for Veterans. The Partnership will develop an underutilized parcel of Brighton Marine Health Center’s campus located at [1465 Commonwealth Avenue](#) in Brighton Massachusetts. The Project will be mixed-income, providing access to affordable housing for individuals earning 30% to 80% of area median income as well as a portion set-aside as workforce housing units. The Project will also serve a range of individual and family sizes through the creation of studio-, one-, two-, and three- bedroom units. Common area amenities including on-site laundry facilities, on-site management, a fitness room, an indoor recreation area, and resident lounge and outdoor courtyard will be created as part of the redevelopment. The Project will benefit from a variety of private and public funding sources. Estimated completion projected for Winter of 2020.

Administration Issues:

Commissioner Watson asked the status of project. **Dan Moore (Cranshaw Construction)** stated current status of construction is demolition, abatement, site work and excavation. Final completion of project estimated December 2019.

Procedural Issues:

Commissioner Watson asked about workforce outreach. Sandy Paben, Compliance Officer (Renaissance Groups) stated they held a recruiting fair last week. Sent out 200 post cards to minority owned businesses, and will

continue outreach throughout the project. **Commissioner Wright** asked about turnout. **Sandy** stated 26 people from community (a few skilled), MWBE Painters and Cleaners. **Commissioner Watson** asked what the conversation on BRJP goals has been. LeAnn (Winn Development), Cranshaw realizes we are trying to reach goals, and are looking at subcontractors past performance with BRJP. **Dan Moore** (Cranshaw) states there is no language in contract to w/hold payment, but understands fines will be assessed under the New BRJP ordinance, if found in non-compliance. To address walk-ons, Cranshaw will put up signs and identify one day a month they will meet in person with walk-on applicants. Commissioner Watson also urged them to reach out to Jobs Bank. **Commissioner Fortune** asked about subcontractors awarded. Dan stated they are in beginning stages of buyout.

Public Comment:

Janet Jones (Boston Jobs Coalition): Outreach off to good start. Marguerite Concrete’s history hiring Boston Residence is not good, “Do not hire!”

Commissioners’ Request: No requests.

B. Parcel K Garage/Residential

Duration: 18 mins

Commissioner Redd disclosed he is related to Brooke Woodson (Suffolk Construction), and he has no involvement in this project that would pose a conflict of interest.

Present: John Cappellano (Lincoln Property Co.), Michael Foster (Lincoln Property Co.), Frank Craemer (Suffolk Construction), Brian Regan (Suffolk Construction), Brooke Woodson (Suffolk Construction), Margarita Polanco (Suffolk Construction), Corey Allen (Suffolk Construction), Pamela Ruffo (BRJP Monitor).

Project Overview:

A DIPP project, Parcel K Garage/Residential located at 895-899 Northern Ave., Boston, MA consists of two parts: Garage Component: is a one level parking garage that may contain up to a maximum of 450 parking spaces through the installation of mechanical stackers and managed operations. Residential Component: is a 12 story building with 304 residential units, together with approximately 12,029 square feet of office space and approximately 10,787 square feet of retail and restaurant space. Estimated to be completed in Spring of 2020.

Administration Issues:

John Cappellano (Owner-Lincoln Property Co.) presented visual rendering of project. **Commissioner Watson** asked if he was confident they will meet BRJP goals. **Mr. Cappellano** replied that he was confident they will do the best they can and do a great job. **Brian Regan (Suffolk)** stated they are onsite and the overall duration of project is 28 months. **Commissioner Watson** expressed that correspondence should be consistent in the overall course of the project and is concerned of the owner’s uncertainty of reaching BRJP goals. There is language to w/hold payment in every contract, reinforced in scope of work and at weekly meetings. **Pam (BRJP Monitor)** stated, initial pre-cons has happened, Hayward Baker was informed that due to their past history they would be looked at more intently to perform better. Hayward Baker is currently making efforts in communicating and providing correspondence. Pam impressed with Hayward Baker’s first week on the job, their forecast numbers look great. **Commissioner Watson** reiterates that substantive correspondence to/from unions is what the BEC is looking for.

Procedural Issues:

Commissioner Fortune asked if subcontractors have been awarded. **Brian and Frank (Suffolk)** verbalized 9 subcontractors awarded to date (*list to be submitted*): Liberty (Concrete), Canatal (Structural Steel), Component Assembly Systems (Dry Wall), JK Glass (Curtain Wall), EM Duggan(HVAC/Fire Proofing), American Plumbing (Plumbing), Otis (Elevator), Lyimo (Exterior wall panels) and Averill Electric (Electrical). **Commissioner Cofield** expressed that there are red flag contractors on the list who don’t care about meeting compliance (ie, Derenzo, Liberty, Hayward Baker) and asked what other systems are in place to meet the compliance standards if not getting referrals through union halls. He stated to Brooke and Margarita, a slap on the wrist is not enough. We

need to utilize manpower we have in this city. **Brooke (Suffolk)** agreed and stated they have been focusing on Liberty, and will give the subs opportunity to show where their pipeline is. **Commissioner Watson** concluded by saying when he heard Hayward Baker, a red flag went up and urged Pam to get documentation.

Commissioners Request: No requests.

III. Project Reviews

A. Residences at Fairmont Station

Duration: 18 mins

Present: Bob Vance (Southwest Boston - SWB CDC), Will Galloway (Delphi Construction), Robert Woodson (BRJP Monitor).

(Discrepancy with Construction Cost on BEC Report cover page, has been confirmed and corrected from \$12,370,535 to \$8,075,450)

Project Overview:

Current overall numbers: 5,619 wkhrs, 32%R/46%POC/2%F

Issues: Low Boston Resident and Female performance, 10 day submission time for weekly payroll and 60% Boston Residents verification rate.

Administration Issues:

Commissioner Watson asked what's the plan and strategy for improving low Boston Residents and Female performance. **Will** states application boxes on site produced hiring of two walk-ons and they reach out to Jobs Bank. **Commissioner Watson** asked for a letter from Hope Trucking, Augiar Landscaping, and MPS Construction on the challenge of submitting payrolls on-time. **Will Galloway (Delphi Construction)** stated that Hope and MPS completed their work. **Commissioner Watson** commented, had this been under the New Ordinance it would have been financially unfortunate for them. **Will** stated that Augiar and DA Bosworth have a couple weeks of work remaining and 12 of 13 Boston Residents have been verified. **Robert (BRJP Monitor)** to confirm verifications. **Commissioner Watson** wants to see Augiar before August 2018 completion, but left it to the discretion of Robert as to whether that remains necessary. **Robert** noted Augiar has made a significant Best Faith Effort.

Commissioner Fortune asked who are subcontractors awarded (identify MWBEs/Section 3): Hope Trucking (Off site), Diaz Construction, Augiar (MBEs), All State Waste (WBE), Monahan/HVAC, and A&E Fire. A subcontractor list was handed out to the Commissioners. It was stated that MPS (Non-union) hired 2 Boston Residents and their numbers were 22%R, 50%POC, 0%F. **Commissioner Watson** made the point that data speaks volumes and defended Diaz numbers (BRJP History) at 13,000hrs from 7/2009 – 2/2018 they are at 48%BR and 62%POC.

Commissioner Fortune asked about the total construction cost. **Will Galloway (Delphi Construction)** stated \$8mil. A discrepancy in the construction cost listed on the BEC report (\$12,370,535) was noted. **Bob Vance (SWB CDC)** explained that there are soft cost related that perhaps brings it to \$12mil. Commissioner Fortune asked for follow-up on this discrepancy. BRJP staff will follow-up.

Procedural Issues:

Commissioner Watson applauded the doubling of POC numbers and Diaz Construction's improved. He suggested outreach to PGTI/Susan Moia as a best practice resource for the low female performance. **Commissioner Cofield** advised construction team to ensure paperwork is filled out right for Diaz Construction, Turnkey, and Innovation (specifically resident verification). Robert commented that all Boston residents for Diaz were reported with different addresses (no conflicts noted to date).

Public Comment:

Weezy Waldstein – Why aren't Innovation and Turnkey listed on report? **Commissioner Fortune** explained that the BEC report just list top 5 trades and contractors.

Vincent Coyle (Local 7 BA), asked how many females Diaz Construction employed. Robert stated 1 female laborer. 0% Iron workers. **Commissioner Cofield** notes that Vincent Coyle from Local 7 (Iron Workers) made public comment because of the trade misclassification that's happening.

Janet Jones (Boston Jobs Coalition) Keep eye on Diaz. Glad they're reforming. Disappointed in female numbers.

Commissioners' Request:

By 3/9/18 submit: **1)** A Corrective Action Letter from, DA Bosworth, and Augiar Landscaping, on increasing Boston Resident and Female participation. **2)** A Letter from Augiar explaining late payroll submissions.

B. Quincy Towers Apartments

Duration: 22 mins.

Commissioner Watson recused himself due to his employer, Mass Housing Investment Corporation being a funding source for this project.

Commissioner Redd Chairs.

Present: Gina Martinez (Beacon Communities), Robert Bradley (Keith Construction Inc.), William Plante (Keith Construction Inc.) Claudette Austin (BRJP Monitor).

(Correction made on BEC Report pg. 3 – number of unverified Boston Residents should be 11 not 14)

Project Overview:

Current numbers are 22,187wkhrs, 46%R, 68%POC, 2%F. Construction is 88% complete.

Low Boston Resident and Female performance, 77% Boston Resident verification rate, Carpenters trade has lowest participation for POC at 13%.

Administration Issues:

Commissioner Redd asked Claudette (BRJP Monitor) if she found GC to be responsive. **Claudette** replied yes, however, has had issues with payroll reporting, which GC explains is due to 3rd party payroll vendors used by majority of subcontractors causing lapse in turnaround. Majority of hours remaining is for Painters. They are in completion mode along with mechanical work, fire protection, and electrical. **Commissioner Redd** recommends they work on female numbers. Update – as of today, project has 11 unverified Boston Residents. Best Faith Efforts letters were handed to Claudette.

Procedural Issues:

Commissioner Redd questions low female percentage and asked if they've reached out to Susan Moia. **GC** stated they reached out to other organizations, can't speak to Susan Moia. They have letters of outreach. Outreach to Jobs Bank? No. **Commissioner Wright** asked if GC was satisfied with response. They stated 50/50 and could have followed up better. **Commissioner Wright** stated that 0% female for Carpenter surprises her and requested copy of letters from Claudette. **Commissioner Fortune** asked Developer if she was comfortable with Keith Construction (GC). **Gina Martinez**, (Beacon Communities) stated that Beacon is an all-female company and not shy of holding people accountable. They hold weekly meetings, and feel the GC takes it seriously. **Commissioner Fortune** asked about buyout list. Pan Electrical (MBE), Hoon Contracting (WBE supplier), Pavilion Floors, Payne Painting (MBE), Superior Plumbing - Overall 31/32% MBE participation. **Gina** states she tried to bring on at least 4 union contractors. **Commissioner Cofield** for future jobs, be vigilant about who we're using.

Public Comment:

Janet Jones, Boston Jobs Coalition, Hit or miss on subcontractors - Pan Electric performed very well. In future GC should start a competition using Pan Electric as an example. To which the GC commented that's the reason we awarded Pan Electric.

Commissioner's Request:

GC provided Correspondence to Claudette during this meeting.

C. **Moxy Hotel**

Duration: 20 mins

Present: Tessa Davies (Trademark Partners), Jon Connors (Lee Kennedy), Adriane Pina (Lee Kennedy), Manuel Barbosa (BRJP Monitor).

(Carpenters Trade numbers on BEC Report pg. 3, corrected to match numbers on pg. 2 at 12%R, 12%POC, 12%F)

Project Overview:

Current numbers are 20,671wkhrs, 39%R, 36%POC, 7%F.

Issues: Carpenters trade performing below employment standards for Boston Residents and People of Color. Laborers trade, at 3%, needs more female participation. Current payroll submission is at 10 days.

Administration Issues:

Commissioner Watson commented on the fluctuation of the numbers and pointed out the good and the not so good. He states POC above goal overall, Female 3 – 7 (a plus), Flett 0 – 5 (a plus), South Coast Steel, 6%F (a plus), Hub 11%F (a plus), 96% Boston Residents verified (a plus). Decrease in resident numbers? South Coast completed their work. **Commissioner Fortune** asked about subcontractors awarded: S&F, Fred Williams, Commonwealth Plumbing, MacDonald, Maganaro, Ipswich, NER, Ryan Iron, Grinnell Fire Protection. **Commissioner Watson** thanked the GC's leadership for hearing and hitting it on the female numbers.

Procedural Issues:

S&F is hindering our numbers per **Adriane (Lee Kennedy)**. She recommends Manny (BRJP monitor) pull them in for Corrective Action Meeting. Maia Steel was not in pre-con, but they're on-site. **Commissioner Watson and Commissioner Wright** comments that they like Adriane's proactive compliance approach which is key. Maia Steel will be on site another 8 months. Hayward Baker has minimal work remaining. **Commissioner Watson** comments on payroll submission, **Adriane** states she came on in March and has made efforts to rectify the gaps. Project has 1 ½ years remaining. **Manny** commented that Commonwealth needs a Corrective Action Meeting. Adrienne will send out written notices for corrective action plan following corrective action meetings.

Public Comments:

Janet Jones (Boston Jobs Coalition), Moxy on the right track. You don't need to hire Hayward Baker anymore.

Commissioners Request: No requests.

IV. **Directors Report:**

Duration: 8 mins

Posted additional monitor position to replace Sheryce Hearn's, who is now Deputy Director!

Reminder to Commissioners about the Appreciation Reception for Boards and Commissions on Monday, February 26 at The Boston Foundation. Karilyn will not be able to attend, and hopes that the Commissioners will be able to.

Directors Report was accepted and approved.

Meeting adjourned at 4:52PM.